SHRI RAOOF VALIULLAH : Let him submit a separate resolution. There can be no point of order on the behaviour or conduct of a Member. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : My point of order should be heard...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA : I have a point of order.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Can I explain my point of order, Madam ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : If you are raising the issue....Just a minute, let me answer him.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : How can you answer ? I have not said anything...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : About the lady, I have already said that there is no point. Let us not quarrel about that... How many times you have misbehaved and others have misbehaved ? I do not take any...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : You hear me first. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All of you are not behaving very well. There is no point.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : You first hear the point of order and then give the ruling. How can you say there is no point of order ? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : You have got to hear the point of order. I have got a point of order. He has got a point of order.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : You hear me first. Then give the ruling.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : You hear my point of order first.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Will you allow me...

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS : No, no.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : Mr. Salve...CAG Report...I want the report of Mr. Salve's speech here...

श्री मीर्जा इर्शादबेग : उपसभापति महोदया, मैं आपके माध्यम से सरकार का ध्यान एक बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण विषय की ओर आकर्षित करना चाहता हूं। मैं आशा करता हूं कि सदन के तमाम सम्मानीय सदस्य मेरी इस भावना में साथ देंगे।... **(व्यवधान)** ...

माननीया, यह बीहेवीयर की बात करते हैं। आप उनका बीहेवीयर **देखिए**। ...**(व्यवधान)** ... अगर नीति इनकी पार्टी मानती है, तो इस्तीफा दे दें।... **(व्यवधान)**...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The House is adjourned till 2.30 p.m. for lunch.

The House then adjourned for lunch at sixteen minutes past one of the clock.

The House reassembled after lunch at thirty-two minutes past two of the clock. **The Deputy Chairman** in the Chair.

RE. RESIGNATION BY OPPOSITION MEMBERS FROM LOK SABHA

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I have to start my Namaste from left to right.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY (Karnataka) : May I have permission to say a few words ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Yes. How many people are going to speak ?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : Leaders of...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Not all. Leader...

श्री जसवंत सिंह (राजस्थान) : आपने नहीं फरमाया मैं लीडर नहीं हूं।

उपसभापति : हमारे लिए तो सभी लीडर हैं ।

श्री जसवंत सिंह : मैं लीडर नहीं हूं, यह ठीक बात है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I didn't say that. Don't put words in my mouth. You are putting so many things in the House. Yes, Mr. Gurupadaswamy. Let us start on a calm note.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : Madam Deputy Chairman, today will go down as a unique day in the history of our country. I say this because for the first time in the life of Parliament almost all the Members of the Opposition, our colleagues in the other House, tendered their resignation. By tendering their resignation, if I am allowed to use the words of *The Times of India* in its editorial today, Parliament has been reduced to the position of a ....

SHRI SURESH KALMADI (Maharashtra) : I am on a point of order. Resignation tendered in the other House and a matter about the other House cannot be discussed in this House. These Members have not resigned. How can they speak ? (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu) : I am on a point of order. If he is making a speech, then all of us should be allowed to make a speach.

SHRI N. E. BALARAM (Kerala) : It is an understanding with the Chairman. How can you object ? (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please, sit down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL (Punjab) : You give us time also. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I will not make a reference to the Editorial. All right. Everybody can read it. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Gurupadaswamy, you address to me. (*Interruptions*) Just a minute. You see, the convention is that whatever happens in the other House, we don't refer to that in this House. But, as you said that it is an extraordinary situation. I have allowed you to speak. So, please be brief and mention whatever you want to. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SURESH KALMADI : They have only tendered resignation. What is the extraordinary situation ? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : Madam, I promise you, I will abide by the Chair. I take your own words "an extraordinary situation" was created and it was met by an extraordinary decision on the part of the Opposition leaders and the parties. The country is facing not only a political crisis but...

SHRI VITHALBHAI M. PATEL (Gujarat) : There is no crisis.

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM (Tamil Nadu) : If there is no crisis, you keep quiet. Why do you cry ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am allowing Congress Members

also to speak. If you have any objection, you can raise it during your speech.

SHRI VITHALBHAI M. PATEL : They won't listen. They will make *hulla gulla*.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : They have given me an assurance that they will not make *hulla gulla* when you speak.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : In spite of your ruling they are defying the Chair.

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह (मध्य प्रदेश) : मैडम, एक बात कहनी है कि जब यह बोलेंगे तो हम नहीं बोलेंगे, जब हम बोलेंगे और यह बीच में बोलेंगे तो अच्छा नहीं होगा । . . . (व्यवधान) . . .

SHRI JAGESH DESAI (Maharashtra) : Madam, if this debate goes outside the parameter, I think, this House will never discuss anything. That is why...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please be seated. If anybody goes out of the parameter, the Chair is there to look after.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry) : They will break their own assurance.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please sit down. Mr. Gurupadaswamy has personally assured me that they are not going to make *hulla guila*.

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह : आप बोलिए जो बोलना है लेकिन फिर आप देखिए कि ये बोलते हैं या नहीं बोलते उस वक्त । . . . (व्यवधान)

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF WATER RESOURCES AND THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI M. M. JACOB) : When Mr. Gurupadaswamy concludes his speech, somebody from this side also should get a chance to express his opinion.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : All right. ..*(Interruptions)*. .After Mr. Gurupadaswamy concludes his speech they want that somebody from the Congress party also should be given a chance to express his opinion.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I have no objection. I have no quarrel at all. Let anybody speak. You are in the Chair, you can allow anybody.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I would request Members from the left and the right to maintain decorum of the House. Let us go within certain parameters and let us not set certain precedents which we are doing today. Generally we do not discuss about Lok Sabha here ; since you have requested me, I have allowed you. Please abide by that.

SHRI M. M. JACOB : This side also will mention about Lok Sabha.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH (West Bengal) : Above all, Mr. Jacob may also be allowed to speak at the end.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : My friends in the ruling party do not see any crisis. God only should save them. May I proceed ? The country is facing not only political crisis but also moral crisis... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : You people must be in Panchayati Raj but unfortunately have come here.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : If there has been an indictment, even a minor indictment of the Government in any democratic country of the world, the least that the Government would have done was to lay down office, to resign.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN : Ask Mr. Rama Rao.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I do not have brief for others. I can speak for myself... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Jagesh Desai, your name is with me and I am allowing you to speak and then you make your point.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : You can speak anything you like but let me speak my own mind.

If in any democratic country in the world, an indictment has been made by an important authority, the Government would have fallen. In Japan, we have heard of scandals. What happened there ? Takeshita had to resign and his successor had to face great crisis. His party has been defeated in the Senate elections.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I hope you will not be able to do that here...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : The Congress Party is the premier party of India. Once I belonged to that party. That party set up sometimes highest standards, let me remind them. When there was a small railway accident, Lal Bahadur Shastri had to resign ... (*Interruptions*). When Mundhra scandal was discussed ...(*Interruptions*) Shri T. T. Krishnamachari had to resign. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : They are not discussing the motion, they are discussing the resignation of the Members of Lok Sabha He is reacting to the resignation ... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I may also refer to Ghani Khan's resignation. The Public Accounts Committee made an adverse observation on him when he was a Minister. He had to resign. Mr. Sanjiva Reddy had to resign as Chief Minister for minor offences. Here is a case where there is a major moral lapse committed by Mr. Rajiv Gandhi and his Government ...(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Gurupadaswamy, we are discussing the resignation ...(*Interruptions*) ... Will you please sit down ? I think, I can handle it very well. If you sit down calmly, I will handle it. Mr. Gurupadaswamy, I thought we are discussing the resignation of the Members from the other House and not the Prime-Minister. So please don't mention him. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MADAN BHATIA (Nominated) : I want to raise a point of order. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I am only referring to that. Resignations were tendered by our colleagues because of what ? Resignations were tendered by Members of the Opposition in the other House because there was no option but to resign and set a noble example. ...(*Interruptions*) ... I thought, Madam, after our colleagues had tendered resignations today morning. Mr. Rajiv Gandhi also will follow that example set by us, by our colleagues. They have shown the way. Members of the Opposition have resigned. They have not committed any moral wrong. They have not committed any unethical act. They have resigned because of the*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Don't record it. (*Interruptions*) ...

*Not recorded.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : There was no option but to resign. We representatives owe to the nation ...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI JAGESH DESAI : What he said should not go on record.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : That should not be recorded. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That is removed from the record. Please sit down. It has gone out of the record. I am here to look after the record, not the Members alone. I have a responsibility towards this House. I am seeing that anything unparliamentary is not going on record. It will not go on record. (*Interruptions*). I am concerned about today. I am responsible for what anybody speaks if he is speaking with my permission. It includes all of you, the entire House.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I will just remind them. When Mr. Rajiv Gandhi came to power, he gave an assurance and commitment to the nation that he would give a clean administration. (*Interruptions*). I want to remind him and his Government and the House about the commitment he made to the nation. I want that commitment to be fulfilled. (*Interruptions*). Today he has forfeited all moral authority to stay in power. I am now reminding you of a historic example because I do not want to take much of the time of the House. During the time of Robert Walpole in England...(*Interruptions*).

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : उत्तर प्रदेश यह इतिहास पढा रहे हैं ?... (व्यवधान)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : Robert Walpole also stayed in power for long. Let me tell them. Robert Walpole was able to stay in power in England for twenty years, by adopting various corrupt and devious methods. (*Interrupt ons*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : If anybody makes a comment, I will stop the discussion. Mr. Gurupadaswamy gave me an assurance that nobody is going to disturb. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I am ending with this. Lord Macaulay, while writing about Robert Walpole said the Government of Robert Walpole was a Government of corruption, by corruption, through corruption. (*Interruptions*). This epithet applies squarely, fully, completely, to Rajiv Gandhi and his Government. My demand is, Rajiv Gandhi should tender his resignation, he must get out ; he must quit.

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह: इतना जस्टीफाई कर रहे हैं तो यह इस्तीफा क्यों नहीं देते लोक सभा में इनके लोगों ने इस्तीफा दिया है तो ये अपने साथियों के साथ क्यों नहीं चले जाते ? ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI ANAND SHARMA ((Himachal Pradesh) : Madam Deputy Chairman, I am anguished to hear what Shri Gurupadaswamy has just said. He is a senior Member of this House. He has referred to past precedents and has termed this day as a unique day in the history of Indian parliamentary democracy. Madam, as a Memeber of this House, I think that this is a dark day for Indian democracy because we have..... (*Interruptions*). I say dark, Madam, because we have an Opposition bereft of any direction, leadership or morals, an Opposition which has run away from its responsibility in a parliamentary democracy, an Opposition which does not have the moral courage to participate in a debate and face the reality. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM: Six times we have participated.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: You sit down. It has taken recourse to the escapist route because it is not prepared to contribute in any manner, to preserve or strengthen this hard-earned democratic set-up in this country. Nothing prevented the Opposition from coming forward and participating in a discussion. I am not going into the subject-matter. I have always believed that the people in this country are sovereign and we are the representatives of the people. Parliament can discuss anything and everything which is related to the nation, to its people. But we have people who have questioned this right and have used the forum of Parliament not to serve the people of India but to serve their narrow political ends by enacting dramas obstructing proceedings and by sensationalising the report...

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh): Crores and crores of rupees were swindled by way of pay-offs.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Mr. Gurupadaswamy has said that the opposition Members have resigned to strengthen political morality. He has given a long sermon on political morality. Their resignations have nothing to do with that. It is political hypocrisy and not political morality. If they talk of political morality, if they feel so strongly about this issue, I would like to ask senior Members of this House who are presidents of the political parties which have taken the decision for their members to quit the Lok Sabha, if it is really political morality, if that is the yardstick what prevents the leaders of those parties from resigning as members of this House? Why don't they resign from here? That is why I term this as political hypocrisy, a deliberate move, to hoodwink the people. These are double standards. When they talk of the report and say that the Prime Minister should have resigned, I would like to ask : Is there even a comma or a fullstop which indicts the Prime Minister or the person of the Prime Minister? There is no mention, no indictment, whatsoever. If there are procedural matters or certain matters which related to Defence policy, it is not an indictment of the Government ... (*Interruption*)...rather a positive mention about the Prime Minister and the directives which he gave on the 24th March 1986. If in the face of this report —I go a step forward—on this controversy or issue if there is any person in Indian politics who should be condemned and who should be forced to withdraw from politics, it is Vishwanath Pratap Singh, the then Finance Minister, who was not only privy and party to all the decisions, but V.P. Singh as Finance Minister approved this particular contract in his capacity as... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM: V. P. Singh resigned; let the Prime Minister also resign then.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Well, I am surprised by their naivety that they do not know that it is the Finance Minister who had to okay the contract and it was V.P. Singh who is their *messiah*, their leader, now, but whom I term as the biggest hyprocrite moving around in this country, a wolf in the garb of a sheep, who was not only a party to this decision but approved this contract and for two years kept quiet. It was only after he moved out of the Congress—he was expelled for his acts of treachery—that he was suddenly reminded of Bofors and the contract. If you have any moral standards, if you want to set any standards in this country, disown V.P. Singh as your leader and ask him to quit politics and pay for his deeds. (*Interruptions*) Madam, I may also mention...

(*Interruptions*)...Madam, I may also say that this resignation which is the biggest exercise of hypocrisy is also with another motive because such issues have provided them... (*Interruptiions*)... with the only ground to unite. As they do not have anything else in common... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a Minute. Mr. Reddy, you tell me why the Opposition Members resigned.

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY: They resigned because the Prime Minister of India has deceived the people...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: How? According to the report. So, if he is mentioning the report, what is the harm?...(*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY (Andhra Pradesh): He is not just mentioning the report. (*Interruptions*)...He is saying something else. These are two different things...(*Interruptions*)... He should not be allowed to say this ...(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You cannot direct me to tell him what he should speak. What he says is within the purview.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Madam, what has compelled me... (*Interruptions*)...to mention this is the fact that we have received a long sermon on political morality from Mr. Gurupadaswamy and I am appealing to his conscience because he belongs to a political party which is led by a person who was then the Finance Minister, Mr. V.P. Singh. What is wrong with that? Can you disown facts and realities? Can you say that Mr. V.P. Singh was not a party to this decision?...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA (Bihar): Madam, I am on a point of order...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRAVATHANENI UPENDRA (Andhra Pradesh): Are we discussing the report, Madam?... (*Interruptions*)... Madam, are we discussing the report or the resignation?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, we are not discussing the report. He cannot pass remarks against Mr. V.P. Singh who is not here to defend himself... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, You have prescribed some parameters.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: You have not allowed Members to go beyond those parameters?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: But now he is going beyond the parameters...(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, he is not going...(*Interuptions*)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: He mentioned Mr. V.P. Singh who is not here to defend himself... (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You people have mentioned about the Members who are not present in the House...(*Interruptions*)...We should not have discussed this thing at all...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: He cannot name Mr. V.P. Singh... (*Interruptions*)...He cannot mention Mr. V.P. Singh and it is totally out of bounds...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Let me give my ruling. Please sit down...(*Interruptions*)... You want my ruling?

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Yes.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: My ruling is that what the Lok Sabha Members do is not discussed here generally, as a convention. If you want to break this convention, naturally this will happen. If you do not want, I will stop the discussion...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, there is a world of difference between discussing the conduct generally and referring to an individual. He is referring to an individual...(*Interruptions*)...you cannot talk about a person who is not here to defend himself. I would like a ruling on this...(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: My ruling on this is this: On the request of the Members of the Opposition including Mr. Gurupadaswamy, Mr. Dipen Ghosh, Mr. Upendra and Mr. Mishra, I have allowed this. If you want to object, you are most welcome. I will immediately stop this discussion and go to the other business... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: You have totally misunderstood me... (*Interruptions*)...You are totally misunderstanding me. Is it within the rules of this House that a person who is not here to defend himself can be mentioned?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Actually, this is also not within the rules—discussing what happenes in the Lower House. But that is what we are now doing. So, we will stop it now...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: We are not discusising the Lower House...(*Interruptions*)... Madam, we are not discussing the Lower House...(*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: We are then bring the rules. Since we break the rules, let us break all the rules then... (*Interruptions*)

8 P.M.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I know we have broken...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, I want to make one submission. Actually we are not discussing the Lower House. We are discussing the extraordinary situation arising out of the resignation of some M. Ps. We are not discussing the Lower House. So please correct.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We are discussing the unprecedented happenings, according to you, which took place today. And it happens to be that those Members are of the Lower House. If you allow anything to be discussed in this House, definitely some Members are going to take the names. Mr. Gurupadaswamy took the names ...(*Interruptions*) They are not coming to defend themselves. (*Interruptions*) You cannot have your cake and eat it also. It is better you keep quiet. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, you are not in your elements today. Something wrong with you...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Madam, we are discussing unprecedented situation as per Mr. Gurupadaswamy because of the C&AG's report. The C&AG's report refers to a particular contract which I say has the personal stamp of approval of one Shri V.P. Singh who was then the Finance Minister. What is wrong? I am very much within my right..(*Interruptions*) I have not, like them, trasngressed the boundaries of decency, Madam... (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I will stop the discussion. (*Interruptions*) After he finishes, I will stop the discussion. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): The whole situation has arisen out of the meeting held yesterday under the leadership of Mr. N.T. Rama Rao. The whole thing is because of that gentleman. (*Interruptions*) He has to talk..(*Interruptions*) If it is objected to because he is not a Member..(*Interruptions*) we have to talk. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: Madam, I am only trying to say that I am anguished as a member of this House, and what pains me more is that an Opposition which, I have said, is running away from its primary responsibility by sensationalising is trying to tell me what I should say and what I should not say. I would remind them that as a Member of this House I have my own rights and privileges. You are nobody to tell me what I should say and what I should not say. You are nobody... (*Interruptions*)

In fact, I am amused by Mr. Yahwant Sinha defending Mr. V.P. Singh. Shall I quote Mr. Yashwant Sinha on his own Party President? Should I remind him that he had also resigned because he feels that V.P. Singh is opportunist..(*Interruptions*) He has said it. I am quoting him. I am quoting you, Mr. Yashwant Sinha. Do not forget. Have political character and courage and say the same thing about V.P. Singh here. I will admire you and respect you. There is one last thing which I have to mention and that last thing is very important. An important reason for these resignations is that the opposition was unnerved because of the positive and popular response of the people to Rajiv Gandhi and his Government for his pro-people policies and legislation being enacted on Panchayati Raj, for instance. (*Interruptions*) The Panchayati Raj legislation which is opposed by V. P. Singh the leaders of the opposition is meant to give power to the people. In fact, even while taking a decision yesterday to resign from Lok Sabha, the opposition said that they would remain in Rajya Sabha to oppose the constitutional amendment on Panchayati Raj. This is their character. It is their anti-people attitude. Madam, this is the crux of the matter. They never want power to be devolved, to be given to the people. They are vitiating the political atmosphere. But their words and deeds have unmasked their faces.

I would like to conclude by saying that we on this side are aware of our responsibility and commitment to the people of this country. The Congress Party has served the people with dignity and its contribution is a part of history and will be seen and applauded by posterity. Their conduct, their despicable behaviour, their body blows to the institution of Parliament and the manner in which they have tried to destroy the democratic fabric of this country will also be noted and condemned by posterity. The opposition will not be forgiven by history.

Madam, we certainly do not require a sermon from those who have been indicted by courts of law for their acts of corruption and nepotism. Those who are jumping the most have a Chief Minister whose deeds are so corrupt that God save the pople of Andhra Pradesh and the country. His hands are soaked in corruption. I do not want to go beyond that. They should first set their house in order. Remove corrupt Rama Rao, remove corrupt Devi Lal and then come and talk to us. Don't give us sermons here. Thank you, Madam.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Madam Deputy Chairman, an unprecedented situation has arisen follow-

[Shri Dipen Ghosh]

ing wholesale resignation of the entire opposition from Lok Sabha. Madam, I say that this is an unprecedented situation because never in the history of Indian parliamentary democracy has it occurred that the entire opposition has resigned and the House of the People, the Lok Sabha is sitting without the opposition. Madam, a Parliament without opposition is like a marriage without a spouse.

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI K. C. PANT): Madam, what does one do when the spouse runs away?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You may have a marriage without spouse because you are accustomed to have a Parliament without opposition.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): What happened in West Bengal in 1972?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am not going to speak outside the parameters you have set. But, Madam, I have noted what Mr. Anand Sharma, my colleague has spoken. He has spoken of two things. One is that the Opposition by resigning has betrayed the people or has not exercised their job assigned to them by the people. Madam, Mr. Anand Sharma himself has stated that the people are sovereign.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: If I may correct you, I said that you have run away from your responsibility...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: All right. Mr. Anand Sharma has stated that people are sovereign. Madam, the Opposition has gone to that sovereign people by resigning from Parliament. Now you resign and go to the people and let the people decide who is right and who is wrong because... (*Interruptions*) Just listen....

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I only said that the people are sovereign and this Parliament is the representative of the people. I was referring to the Report. We have a right to discuss everything...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, I did not interrupt him.....(*Interruptions*) Madam, the Opposition has resigned. All the Opposition Members have resigned with the expectation that the Leader of Mr. Anand Sharma would also resign...(*Interruptions*) and will go to the court of the people and will seek their fresh mandate. If the Opposition is wrong, the people will judge whether the Opposition Members have run away or not. The people will judge, not surely Mr. Anand Sharma or his cohorts. (*Interruptions*) They have gone to the people on their own. (*Interruptions*) They have gone to the people on their own six months before they are supposed to go. So, they have shown their courage.... (*Interruptions*) They have shown their courage to face the people and the people's verdict. If you have the courage, if your Leader has the courage, resign and face the people and seek their mandate. Madam, the second point which Mr. Anand Sharma has stated was...(*Interruptions*)

डा० एस० कर पाण्डेय : ताकत है, तो रिजाइन कर दो।... (व्यवधान) अब रिजाइन करो। क्या मारल वैल बनते हो ?

श्री दीपेन घोष : पंडित जी आप बैठ जाइये।

डा० एस० कर पाण्डेय : भाषण न कम नहीं बनेगा। जनता के बीच में रिजाइन करके जाइये। आपने लोक सभा से रिजाइन किया है, इस सदन को गुमराह मत कीजिए। इस सदन का अपमान बर्दाश्त मत कीजिए।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam, the second point which Mr. Anand Sharma has developed is parliamentary democracy. He said that the Parlia-

ment has to be upheld, Parliamentary democracy has to be upheld. Yes. But what have we seen? We have been seeing for the last three or four years that every single democratic institution whi ch is called democratic under the parliamentary democracy has been sought to be demolished by the ruling party at the Centre...(*Interruptions*) I may draw your attention that the President's right to know has been denied by this ruling party. The institution of Governor has been denigrated. The institution of Governor has been used to serve the purpose of the ruling party. (*Interruptions*) In the name of committed judiciary, judiciary has been sought to be interfered with. In the name of upholding parliamentary democracy, they have withheld reports of the Inquiry Commissions and important papers from Parliament.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: And when reports are sought to be discussed they run away.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Only when this was published in the newspapers, they came forward. Initially they started by saying that it was newspaper creation. Only when Opposition insisted upon it, they had to come to Parliament with that report. In the past, on every conceivable occasion in respect of every parliamentary democratic institution they have demolished it and last but not the least, the independence of this authority, the CAG, has been sought to be denigrated, the other day by Mr. N.K.P. Salve. I can quote from his speeches given on the floor of this House. (*Interruptions*). He has stated and I quoted that he should be asked to go...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: That debate you had boycotted, I thought.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: All right, all right. I am only reminding how the independent audit institution has been sought to be denigrated. Madam, you are aware better than me that the CAG cannot be dismissed, CAG has to be impeached. If CAG has done any wrong, as Mr. Salve has stated, why his party is not bringing a resolution for the impeachment of Mr. T.N. Chaturvedi, the Comptroller and Auditor General of India?

AN HON. MEMBER: He can bring it.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: This is only drama. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI K. C. PANT: Madam, obviously my friend feels rather strongly on the issue. Is he going to exercise his democratic right to participate in the debate which is taking place in the House?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: That day I had stated and you were not present in the House and I think you did not find time to go through the debate in this House; otherwise you would not have raised this point; because we had said that the CAG report calls for action and not discussion. If you as Defence Minister would have come...

SHRI K. C. PANT: Are you not going to participate?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: If as Defence Minister you would have come forward with an "action taken" report on the CAG report in Parliament, then we would have discussed your "action taken" report, not the CAG report. Madam, the question is of upholding parliamentary democracy, as Mr. Sharma has stated. I was simply citing the example how every institution of Parliamentary democracy has been sought to be demolished and in their last attempt they have sought to denigrate the CAG, the independent audit institution. So the Opposition wanted the Government --I am not blaming anybody--headed by Mr. Rajiv Gandhi, the Prime Minister to own the responsibility of indictment made by the CAG in his report and resign to seek fresh mandate. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI K. C. PANT: Let him participate in the debate. Why is he running away from the debate? He is entitled to his views. But under the cover of trying to speak on something else he is really speaking on a matter which is before the House and which is being debated. How far is it proper? Let him participate in the debate. We would like to know his views. We would welcome his views. There is nothing wrong in that. If he has certain views in the matter, the right thing would be to participate in the debate. This is not the way. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: When we started the discussion, we thought that we are going to discuss only the resignations. We have now come back to the report. I have the list of speakers on the Short Duration Discussion before me. If you like, I can start it.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no.

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह : डिस्कशन में हिस्सा लेना चाहिए ।

उप-सभापति : आप कृपया बैठ जाइए । मुझे पूछ लेने दीजिए इन से कि क्या कह कहे हैं ।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I have referred to Parliamentary democracy which Mr. Sharma wanted.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You have discussed, Parliamentary democracy, I feel, now, Mr. Gurupadaswamy stated when he started that you are going to make a point only. But now it is going on a full-fledged debate. For two minutes you say now. I have to ask the Members to be precise.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I have seen that you have allowed Mr. Sharma ten minutes, not two minutes.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV (Maharashtra): He has already started the debate.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am going to conclude. So, I said that it is hypocrisy talking about upholding the Parliamentary democracy by anybody belonging to that side. This is the history. I wanted to put forward this point. That is why I referred to CAG institution.

SHTI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV: He is already speaking on that. I think we can start the debate. What is his point? He started with resignations and now he is referring to the CAG report. Would he like to speak on that debate?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please conclude.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I wanted to say that a hypocrite himself should not call others hypocrite becaus it is the Congress-I, the ruling party at the Centre which has been constantly and systematically demolishing one after another all the democratic institutions of Parliamentary democracy. Mr. Sharma again wanted to say, and wanted to know also, as to why the opposition parties, the representatives of our parties in the Lok Sabha resigned. I want to make it clear that...

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: I never asked that.

SHRI DIPEN GHOkH: Because they did not want to coexist with the bunch of * and misleaders of the House...

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: That word is unparliamentary.

THE DEPUTY CHAIMAN: I have already asked that not to be recorded. Mr. Desai, I am listening to every word that is spoken. The record will be seen by me in the evening. So don't get agitated.

SHRI K. C. PANT: May I ask Shri Dipen Ghosh if the same principle will apply to West Bengal?

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM: Everywhere.

* No recorded.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Yes, to the Prime Minister, including the Defence Minister who is deliberately misleading the House. Now the CAG report had said it. . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; Why are the Members getting agitated? Instead of getting agitated, give your points and finish it off. Why is everybody getting so agitated? Yes, Mr. Salve.

SHRI GHULAM RASOOL MATTO (Jammu and Kashmir) On a point of order. Is he speaking on the substantive motion?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: (Maharashtra) I am not agitated on the substantive motion. I am not at all agitated.

Madam. I was listening with great amusement to the rhetorics...

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN (West Bengal): Don't use the vulgar language as you used that day.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, I was considerably amused at the great agitated manner in which Mr. Gurupadaswamy and Mr. Dipen Ghosh tried to sermonise us on destroying institutions. Who has been destroying institutions for the last two and a half days or three days is writ large. So let us not talk....

DR. G. VIJAYA MOHAN REDDY (Andhra Pradesh) : Don't talk irrelevant things.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : वो कहते हैं नों, चोर चोरी से चला जाय; हेराफेरी से नहीं जाता । Madam, what, I was wanting to submit is, sometimes when politics becomes too strenous and becomes too heavy, you need some sort of light moment, you need some sort of a humorous situation, and I am happy that a humorous situation has been created by these Charlies resigning in the Lok Sabha..

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Again Charlies?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: "Charlies" is in a good sense; in Hindi and Marathi, it means Chaturvedi. It is a good word.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Are you obsessed with the word 'Charlie'?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: All right. I would say, 'these gentlemen', 'these Members of Parliament'. Madam, if you consider the word 'Charlie' to be unparliamentary, you can remove it. I myself withdraw it when I see him get up. (*Interruptions*) There is humour. There is considerable humour in this situation that these 160 or 106 gentlemen in the other House have tendered their resignations .

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Only 68.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, this kind of gimmickry is aboslutely necessary sometimes. Otherwise, politics become extremely unbearble. Now, it is becoming a little bearable. All of them who have resigned know that only fifteen days are to go...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Why?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : They know that only fifteen days are there for the Session to end and they have nothing to lose. If six months had been left, I have no doubt in my mind that they never would have resigned. They have resigned because they know that this is the last Session. there are only ten or fifteen days and therefore it does not matter. In any case, the Lok Sabha elections are coming in a few days' time.

If they are really serious in making this an issue about corruption against the Prime Minister, if they had really thought that it was unworthy

[Shri N.K.P Salve]

of them to be associated with this, then it is not there but it is here they should have resigned. It is this hypocrisy which has created the humour in the situation. Anyway, Madam, I do not grudge them this. We are happy. If they want to come back, let them come back. If they want to go let them go. We are having elections.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: We will come back without your leader.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: There is a serious aspect of the matter. What is serious is, if you are really concerned about the institutions not being destroyed, are not Parliamentary institutions being destroyed when you say that you find an indictment of the Prime Minister in the report of the C&A.G.,— which we say does not exist—that you would not talk about it and that the Government should resign? Are you not destroying the basic institutions of Parliamentary democracy? (*Interruptions*) Madam, I maintain that there is absolutely no indictment whatsoever if the Prime Minister or of the Government in the report of the C&A.G. Sit down calm (*Interruption.*) Sit down in a calm manner... (*Interruptions*) Let us argue it out. Let us thrash it out. Even now I give you this offer. But you know that you have nothing to fall back upon. In the last six months, our leader's image, our party's image, has been refurnished many times geometrically. It is this that worries them very much. I have never come across a situation like this, an extraordinary situation. You say that there is indictment and, therefore, the Government should resign. If there is an indictment..(*Interruptions*).

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You go to the people.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: We are going to the people. We have gone to the people all these years. We have gone to the people. We are not scared of going to the people at all. We are not scared one bit. I must tell you one thing. We are not a set of people..(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Do you have the courage?

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE; You must understand one thing. If Parliamentary institutions have been preserved and if there have been elections, it is not because of the Communist Party. It is the Congress Party which has nursed and nurtured them. If the norms of democracy have been preserved it is not they who have done it. They have destroyed them. It is we who have nursed and nurtured them. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO (Andhra Pradesh) The Prime Minister sent the Army.. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN; If there are interruptions like this. I promise you that I am going to stop this discussion.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Mr. Gurupadaswamy, in his own manner, waxed some eloquence about double standards and he said that even the slightest indictment of a Government must bring out its resignation in confrmity with the highest norms of democracy. If I have understood you correctly, this is what you have said. You said that the indictment of a Government on grounds of corruptions or involvement of moral turpitude of any nature must impel the Government to resign. Madam, not long ago, because 11 years is not too long a period in the history of a nation, in this very House when we were sitting on that side, Mr. Gurupadaswamy was sitting somewhere, and here Mr. Advani was sitting, this House passed a resolution asking for appointment of a

Commission of Inquiry against the son of a Prime Minister and against the son-in-law of the Home Minister and what did they do? This was a remote indictment. Here you are calling ' something indictment which does not exist. Here a resolution was passed by a majority and what happened? Nothing moved. The Prime Minister remained.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Madhya Pradesh) : I forced the Government to appoint an Inquiry. I tendered my reisgnation and I said I will not withdraw it unless an inquiry was appointed.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE; : I was coming to that. Mr. Advani interfered a little too early. There was already a difference simmering between them. Mr. Advani resigned, but did you tell the Prime Minister to resign?

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I had no differences with the Prime Minister.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Did the Prime Mtnister resign? You are preaching morality. (*Interruptions*). Now, Mr. Advani is a very restrained and balanced parliamentarian. I ask him, should we accept it because just you say that there is an indictment? (*Interruptions*). No, CAG report does not say tnat. Thet is the heart of the matter. CAG report does not say that. You discuss it with us. If you discuss with us, we will prove to you that whatever else it may contain, it does not contain....(*Interruptions*).

SHRI ALADI ARUNA : *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM ; Then that is a different report, I suppose.

SHRI N.K.P SALVE: About the language, I used, maybe some of the language I used the other day, perhaps, could have been more temperate...

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI : You ve to apologise. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE:...but on a substantive matter every word, comma, full-stop which I used, is something which I stand by and, one thing I stand by is that there is no indictment whatsoever, however remote, of the Prime Minister or his Government. It exists only in the figment of imagination of the opposition people. This gimmickry is not going to help them. Very shortly we will be going before the people and they will give you the real answer. Please wait till then. Thank you.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam Deputy Chairman, a first rate political crisis has engulfed the nation today. If my friends on the other side thinks that there is no crisis, they are living in a fools' paradise and I can only pity them. Then they said that it is a drama. If it pleases them to call it a drama, let it be, but I can only say that the last scene in the drama is being enacted before the curtain is finally rung on the corrupt and inefficient administration of Mr. Rajiv Gandhi and his party. This is the final scene that is being enacted. (*Interruptions*). Please do not disturb.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: You are also disturbing us.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: They say that we are all unnerved. If you see the faces of the Congressmen today in the Lok Sabha and outside, we know who is really unnerved and if I can reveal the names of the Union Ministers who supported by top industrialists of this country, have been frantically telephoning every political party since Saturday night to stop the resignation, if I say that, it is a shame on them.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Are you doing the job of tapping the telephone?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: He is following Ramakrishna Hegde. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PRAVATHANENI UPENDRA: We know it, we exchange views, we know who is contacting whom.

The Lok Sabha Members who have resigned today deserve the compliments of the nation for serving the nation well and for discharging their duty towards the nation. They are not running away, they have gone to the people. It is not a question of running away. They have gone to the people with a challenge to this Prime Minister to resign and face the people. Actually it is Mr. Rajiv Gandhi and his party who are on the run, not the M.Ps. who have resigned. They are on the run. They are repeatedly chanting from this morning, why the Rajya Sabha Members have not resigned! There is no question of Rajya Sabha Members going to the people. They are not directly elected. That is one valid reason which we have given already. But I can also..Madam..

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: We will go at our time; we will decide at our time.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: The demand itself shows the perverse thinking of the ruling party. Any responsible government, any responsible ruling party should be genuinely sorry for the developmemt which has occurred today in the Lok Sabha. Instead they say, "you also resign". That itself shows their respect for the democracy and the need for the Opposition in a democracy. It is a perverse demand.

But, Madam, we are in a battle to see this corrupt Government out and we know how to marshal our forces, what to do at what time. And we are here to fix you and see you out by the year end. This much can say...(*Interruptions*)

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : उपसभापति महोदया आंध्र प्रदेश के मुख्य मंत्री रामाराव ने ग्रामीण विकास और ग्रामीण रोजगार विकास का कितना रुपया मिसयूज किया है, यहां पर कृषि मंत्री जी बैठे हैं, इनकी ड्यूटी है वे बताएं। इनका वक्तव्य हमने पढ़ा है कि जैसा केन्द्रीय सरकार ने पसा दिया था उसका मिसयूज किया है। वह सदन के सामने रखें। कृषि मंत्री जी सदन में हैं, इनकी बाइंडिंग हो जाती है कि वे सदस्यों की जिज्ञासाओं का जवाब दें.... (**व्यवधान**)

उपसभापति : हम लोग चावल के बारे में डिस्कस नहीं कर रहे हैं, रिजिगनेशन के बारे में कर रहे हैं... (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: The resignation of the Lok Sabha Members arose out of the demand for the resignation of the Prime Minister, Mr. Rajiv Gandhi, who has been indicted by the CAG..

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Can you show a single line about indictment? Will you resign your seat from the Rajya Sabha, if proved wrong? Can you show a single line? Don't tell untruths here. You people are misleading the people of this country.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: All the evidence which appeared in the newspapers before and other evidence have conclusively proved that Mr. Rajiv Gandhi...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Can you show the proof?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Upendra, please, just a minute. Please, one minute...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: There is nothing unparliamentary. Is there anything unparliamentary?

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Similar things have been said earlier.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: They are telling about N.T. Rama Rao. You never objected to that . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. . Just listen.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Why did you not object to that?

उपसभापति : आप बैठ जाइये । मैं इसी पर कुछ कहना चाहती हूं । (व्यवधान) When Mr. Gurupadaswamy, including you all came to my chamber then I discussed the matter with the other people if they were willing to allow you to speak. They said okay, but within the parameters.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA (Andhra Pradesh) : What . . . (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Listen to me. Mr. Gurupadaswamy told me that he would make a small statement and go. Then they said that eveybody would speak. Now, it is not proper, it is not at all nice. You just say that those people have resigned, and that is all about it. How can you discuss the whole thing about it?

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: No.....(*Interruptions*)..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am speaking to him, please listen. I am not talking to you, Prof. Lakshmanna. When I am on my legs, please sit down. I am talking to him personally because he was speaking. Please sit don.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: Doesn't matter.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think there is something basically wrong with you today. You are not understanding any point. In my chamber also you were not prepared to understand what I was trying to tell you. We have this report. If you are willing to discuss it, okay, discuss it.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: We will not discuss it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If you don't want to discuss it, don't mention about it; don't go on the basis of that report. Just forget it.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Let me complete.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not going to allow any more. I think, Mr. Upendra, enough is enough. You are the last speaker.

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: You cannot prevent us from.... (*Interruptions*)

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह : डिसकस करने का करेज नहीं है । यह फेस नहीं कर सकते । अगर हिम्मत है तो डिसकस करिये और आइये सामने । (व्यवधान)

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA: Let them say whatever they want, but they cannot prevent us from haveing our say.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, the Prime Minister, aided by the Defence Minister, has made many untrue statements in this House which have been conclusively proved.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: No, no... (*Interruptions*) . . .

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: I would like to know if Upendraji is discussing the report.

SHRI K. C. PANT : Madam, since Mr. Upendra has mentioned my name, I challenge him to participate in a debate and substantiate what he said. Let him substantiate what he said. Let him not run away from the debate. How can he say such wild things?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Has your Department sent your opinions to the CAG..(*Interruptions*).....

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Madam, we have debated for two years....(*Interruptions*).. And all the remarks given by the honourable Minister to the CAG have been rejected outright by the CAG. Therefore, there is no further scope in this.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: What are you talking ?.....(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM: Here is the report. We have everything. You have studied a different chapter.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You are so democratic that you had withheld all the papers from the CAG for two years.

SHRI K. C. PANT: Madam, may I ask my friends in all seriousness, if they are so keen to discuss the report, what is the logic of staying away? Let us discuss it. This is what Parliament is for. Though I am not thrusting my opinions on them. I would like to benefit from their opinions. Even their criticism I would like to benefit from. Why should they not participate in the debate? What is the point in it, what is the logic of staying away? I just don't understand it. I could understand it if they followed the others, resigned and become martyres ...(*Interruptions*)... They have gone to the people for good, it seems. But you don't want to go to the people...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Whether you will come back or they will come back, people will decide.

SHRI K. C. PANT : There is no logic in abstaining from the debate. .....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Why don't you go to the hustings on this issue ?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : We challenge you to face the people Come on. Let us see..(*Interruptions*)

SHRI K. C. PANT : When you have not resigned from the House, why not participate in the debate in an orderly manner ?.. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : You contest from New Delhi again and see whether you will come back....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI K. C. PANT : We will hear you, you hear us. That is a parliamentary practice. And you are talking of democracy ! Is this the way democracy functions ? What is the point in staying away from the debate ? ..(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : For over two years you have not given the papers to the CAG.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I think enough is enough. Mr. Dipen Ghosh, you have had your say. Will you please sit down and allow him to speak? How many times do you want to participate ?

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : He is asking us to participate in the debate.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : But his Department had with held all the papers. (*Interruptions*).

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA : How can we become party to it ?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : If you allow me. I will finish in a minute.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I may tell my friend proved corruption cannot be debated. It is not a matter for debate. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI K. C. PANT : What ?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I am just telling my friend, Mr. K. C. Pant, that proved corruption is not a matter for debate. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI K. C. PANT : I bow to my friends' greater experience in Karnataka. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, Mr. Upendra, you have spoken enough.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : No, I have not spoken enough. I have to say about the final thing. The Prime Minister has lost his mandate.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS : No.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : And he has no moral authority to continue in office. Any other Prime Minister in similar circumstances..

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : You are asking the Prime Minister. You advise your Chief Minister.

ठाकुर जगपाल सिंह : श्री रामाराव के खिलाफ करप्शन के चार्जेज पर हाई कोर्ट ने जजमेंट दिया, उसका क्या हुआ ? आप इस रिपोर्ट पर रेजिगनेशन मांग रहे हैं ? आप उसको डिसकस क्यों नहीं करना चाहते हैं ?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : I can understand their anger about Mr. Rama Rao, because he has fixed them and their leader rightly. We know that. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV : The most corrupt people are talking about the purity of public life. That is their difficulty.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I think it is better you finish now.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : I am finishing. They are not allowing me to do. What can I do ? You control them. Any other Prime Minister in similar circumstances would have resigned, but I know even though elections are only three to four months ahead, Mr. Rajiv Gandhi cannot afford to leave his *Gaddi* for a day, because it is a life and death question for him.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Don't talk all these things. I will not allow. I am very sorry Mr. Upendra you are going beyond your limitations. You cannot cast aspersions on the Prime Minister or anybody like him. I will not allow.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Why.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Why or no why.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : You don't know 'why'.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Chair does not have to answer 'why'. That is all. I don't want to allow because it is not proper.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Is it unparliamentary ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : If you try to say like this again,

[THE DEUPTY CHAIRMAN]: then you will see. You talk about resignations. Why are you going all over the world ?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : I am talking about his resignation.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA : Madam, he has to prove his credentials to Rama Rao.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : He has fixed you rightly. Don't worry, he will fix you further.

If anybody thinks that Mr. Rajiv Gandhi will respond to the situation and will resign, he is a fool. We know he will not do that but the day is not far off when the pack of all these * fellows will be thrown out lock, stock and barrel by the people of this country.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : * is unparliamentary. It will not go on record.

कृषि - मंत्री (श्री भजन लाल) : उपसभापति महोदया, मैं भी बोलना चाहता हूं.....(व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Of all persons, we have to listen to him about corruption.

*Not recorded.

श्री भजन लाल : माननीय उपसभापति महोदया, पिछले साढ़े तीन दिनों से सदन की कार्यवाही को देख करके बहुत भारी हैरानी हो रही है और हैरानी इसलिए हो रही है कि जो माननीय सदस्य यहां पर बैठे हुए हैं वे बहुत ही काबिल और लायक व्यक्ति हैं । सारा देश ही नहीं दुनियां हिन्दुस्तान की तरफ देखती है। हिन्दुस्तान की प्रजातांत्रिक प्रणाली एक ऐतिहासिक प्रणाली है । लेकिन पिछले दिनों में जो कुछ यहां हुआ है और जिस तरह का ड्रामा, सरकस या नौटंकी हुई है, ऐसी पहले कभी आपको इतिहास में मिसाल नहीं मिलेगी । इसका क्या कारण है ? इसका एक ही कारण है* उपसभापति महोदया कि जब प्रजातंत्र में जनता के सम्मुख जाने के लिये उनके पास कुछ मुद्दे नहीं होते और इलेक्शन नजदीक आते हैं तो फिर किसी भी बात का सहारा सियासी आदमी लेते हैं । क्या सहारा लिया इन्होंने कि साहब सी०आई०जी० ने जो रिपोर्ट दी है वह प्रधानमंत्री के खिलाफ है । बगैर पढ़े, बगैर सोचे, बगैर समझे, बगैर अध्ययन किये यह कह देना कि सी०आई०जी० की रिपोर्ट में प्रधानमंत्री की तरफ इशारा है या उसमें प्रधानमंत्री के ऊपर करप्शन के इल्जाम लगे हैं यह कितनी बेबुनियाद बात है । जब कि उसमें एक सेंटेंश में प्रधानमंत्री के खिलाफ नहीं है । अगर इनको बोफोर्स के बारे में बहुत ज्यादा तकलीफ थी तो यह मामला आज से नहीं चल रहा है, ये दो-ढाई साल से इस बात की तरफ लगे हुए हैं, बोफोर्स फोबिया इनको हो गया है । यह फोबिया इनको इसलिये हो गया क्योंकि न तो इनके पास कोई नीति है, न प्रोग्राम है,

न पालिसी है । इसलिये ये चाहते हैं कि किस तरह से राजीव गांधी की सरकार की छवि को धूमिल किया जाए। अगर इनको तकलीफ थी, तो सिद्धांत की बात करते हैं, अगर इनको लगता था कि इसमें वजन है तो आज क्यों, दो साल पहले इनको इस्तीफा दे देना चाहिये था। अगर उस वक्त करते तो फिर तो बात समझ में आ सकती थी । क्या इससे ज्यादा कोई और चीप पब्लिसिटी हो सकती है । इसको हम 15 दिन का बायकाट कह सकते हैं । आप जानते हैं ...(व्यवधान)...पार्लियामेंट का सेशन है । उसकी 14 सिटिंग्स होंगी। हम ही इसको 15 दिन का बायकाट तो कह सकते हैं ।...(व्यवधान)...आप सुनने की कृपा करें । आपकी हरियाणा असेंबली में जरूरत है क्योंकि आप जैसे वहां पर छांट छांट कर भेज रखे हैं ।

मेरे कहने का तात्पर्य यह है उपसभापति महोदया कि किस तरह से इन्होंने इस मामले को पोलिटिकल स्टंड बनाने की कोशिश की । लेकिन इस देश के लोग भोले नहीं हैं । इस देश के लोग वास्तविकता को जानते हैं और फिर नैतिकता की बात मेरे सामने बैठे भाई करें सभी लीडरों का बारी एक एक का इतिहास वे जानते हैं कि उनका किस तरह का इतिहास रहा है । अभी पहले बोलते हुए डिप्टी लीडर साल्वे साहब ने भी एक होममिनिस्टर का जिक्र किया, जो आज इस दुनियां में मौजूद नहीं हैं, उनके खिलाफ बकायदा वैद्यलिंगम कमीशन ने चार्ज साबित किया था, करप्शन साबित किया था और जो प्रधानमंत्री के पद पर भी बने रहे और ये लोग डटकर उनको सपोर्ट करते रहे । एन०टी०आर० की तरफ से अभी श्री उपेन्द्र बोल रहे थे । वे राजीव गांधी के बारे में कह रहे थे और भ्रष्टाचार की बात कर रहे थे । बाकायदा हाई कोर्ट ने उनके खिलाफ वर्डिक्ट दिया है । अगर जरा भी सिद्धांत की बात होती, जरा भी नैतिकता की बात होती तो उनको इस्तीफा दे देना चाहिये था । क्यों नहीं दिया इस्तीफा ? यही राम कृष्ण हेगड़े की बात है, यही हरियाणा में देवीलाल की बात है जो आपके आप को लीडर मानते हैं । आप उनको अपना लीडर मानते हैं जिस का हाथ* । सारा देश यह कहता है कि मर्डर किया गया है।...(व्यवधान)...

श्री महेन्द्र सिंह लाठर (हरियाणा) : आप... (व्यवधान)... आप इनको इजाजत दे रहे हैं इस तरह की, . . . (व्यवधान)...

श्री भजन लाल : यह दुनियां कहती है। (व्यवधान)

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा (उत्तर प्रदेश) : वाइट आफ आर्डर....(व्यवधान)...

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : आपको उनको रोकना चाहिए था (व्यवधान)

It is totally baseless.

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा : आपने मुझको इजाजत दी है न (व्यवधान) उनको बैठ जाना चाहिये । (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : यह कुछ बोल लें । (व्यवधान)

---

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : संसद का दुरुपयोग कर रहे हैं (व्यवधान)

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र (बिहार) : * क्या आपके पेरामीटर में है ? (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If everybody else is going to speak, fine. But as I have allowed him, let him speak.

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा : उपसभापति महोदया, मुझे खेद है कि माननीय भजन लाल जी आपकी उपस्थिति में, आप और मुझे आशा द, आपकी आज्ञा से उन्होंने कई अ दमियों के नाम लिये जो इस हाऊस के मेम्बर भी नहीं हैं । अभी चौधरी देवी लाल की पुत्रवधु, एन.टी. राम राव का, कहीं हेगड़े जी का उन्होंने नाम लिया, आपने उनको इजाजत दी और मैंने इसके लिए आपसे सामने प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर उठाया, आपसे यह कहा कि ऐसी बातों को आपको रोकना चाहिये था । यह तो आपको शुरू में ही रोकना चाहिये था । आपने उपेन्द्र जी को कई दफा रोकने की कोशिश की (व्यवधान)

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : राजीव गांधी का नाम लेते हो रोक दिया (व्यवधान)

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा : राजीव जी जो दोनों हाऊस में आ सकते हैं उनका नाम लेने पर तो आपने रोकने की कोशिश की और इन्होंने बार बार (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : आप गलत मत कहिये । आप हाऊस के सीनियर मेम्बर हैं । मैंने उनका नाम लेने को मना नहीं किया । मैंने यह कहा कि आप किसी पर बिना किसी सबूत के इस तरह से आक्षेप नहीं लगा सकते । अगर उन्होंने कहा है वर-वधु के बारे में, भजन लाल जी कृपया आप वर-वधु की, घरेलू बातें न निकालिये, पोलिटिकल बात कीजिये । (व्यवधान)

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा : जो इस हाऊस का मेम्बर नहीं हैं (व्यवधान)

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : इसको एक्सपंज किया जाना चाहिये (व्यवधान)

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा : जो इस हाऊस का मेम्बर नहीं है उसका नाम नहीं ले सकते । यह एक्सपंज होना चाहिये, मेरी आपसे यह प्रार्थना है । यह मेरा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है इस पर आप रूलिंग दीजिये (व्यवधान)

श्री यशवंत सिन्हा : आपने एक्सपंज किया है या नहीं किया है (व्यवधान)

श्री भजन लाल : मैंने यह बात इसलिए कहा कि प्रजातन्त्र में हर आदमी को अपनी बात कहने का अधिकार है लेकिन कुछ मर्यादाएं होती हैं, कुछ सिद्धान्त होते हैं (व्यवधान)

उपसभापति : अब बैठ जाइये (व्यवधान) अब मुझे अपनी रूलिंग देने दीजिये (व्यवधान)

श्री भजन लाल : मुझे अभी अपनी बात कहनी है (व्यवधान)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: He has asked for my ruling.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, can we answer a point of order?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, you cannot answer it. I have to answer it. You can make your own point of order and let me answer it. Let him make his point of order and let me answer it. (*Interruptions*)....

SHRI DEBA PRASAD RAY (West Bengal): I am on a point of order.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed her. (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI DEBA PRASAD RAY: No, she has relinquished. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: She is raising her own point of order.

* Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SHRI DEBA PRASAD RAY: She has relinquished, (*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It is for me to allow whom I identify. It is not for her to decide who would speak. So, please sit down ... (*Interruptions* ... No, I am not allowing.

Shrimati Jayanthi Natarajan.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, you have allowed something that was totally out of the convention. You yourself said this. You said that normally what has happened in the Lower House is not discussed here. Therefore, you already waived every rule of the House by allowing them to talk about what happened in the Lower House. When they have made all these allegations against my party and my leader which are totally baseless, Madam, can we not raise a point specially about their leaders during the discussion whether they have the moral stand ... (*Interruptions*) ... Whether they have a moral stand ... (*Interruptions*). Madam, can we not...

4.00 P.M.

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा : हमारे लीडर की चर्चा करें, जो हाउस में हैं, दिल खोलकर करें।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have allowed her. She is on her legs.

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN: Madam, therefore, we are going to see the reason why their stand is not correct. They do not have the moral authority to talk about any actions that we will take. How can you possibly ... (*Interruptions*) ... when you have already ... (*Interruptions*) ... the first rule. Secondly, I do not understand how the murder, cold-blooded murder, of a young girl ... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: Madam, what is going on here? It cannot be allowed. I do not know how you are allowing this. If this is the manner in which the proceedings are going to be, then we can also show. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I think the Members are not abiding by my request in the beginning. If they are not keeping within the parameters, it is better we stop the discussion. We close the discussion on it and go back to the short duration discussion.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: What is your ruling?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: My ruling is that the Members are not abiding by certain norms. So there is no point in discussing it.

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA: I am asking about what the Minister has said. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : Please allow the other Members also. Do not go back on the understanding. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just a minute. Please listen to me first. I have allowed Members to speak. You came and requested me. But you cannot abide by the norms. Everybody is going beyond the purview. Forget it. We have discussed it enough. We go ahead with the other discussion. (*Interruptions*).

श्री भजन लाल : हम ठीक हों तो भी नहीं कह सकते हैं। .. (**व्यवधान**)

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA : Madam, you have allowed those who have violated the parameters you laid down. But you are punishing those who have not been allowed so far. What is your judgment? May I ask you?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : How would I know? Everybody gave me promise that they would not go out of the parameters. If you are going out of the parameters, we cannot continue it. (*Interruptions*). Mr. Mishra, we have had enough discussion of it and everybody has put his viewpoints.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: No. Please do not goback on the understanding.

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : We will be within our parameters.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Mr. Bhajan Lal has nothing to say. Please allow others. (*Interruptions*)

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : मुझे बोलने दें। मैं इतनी देर से बोलने की कोशिश कर रहा हूं।

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : We want a debate on the report. There is no question of such a sort of farcical debate being continued. (*Interruptions*). It is totally outside the rules of this House. This is the way how the liberty given by you, Madam, has been exploited. I want a total stop to this debate and I want a debate on the report. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The discussion on the resignation of Members in the other House is over. (*Interruptions*). We are going ahead to the short-duration discussion. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: No, no. Others shall be called. Only three more people are there.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I gave enough time for everybody.

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM: You have not given time to me.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I do not know. I thought there is only one Opposition party.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : If there had been only one Opposition party, this Government would not have been there for so long.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : We have discussed it and you have agreed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Gurupadaswamy, I gave you enough opportunity. Everybody went beyond the purview. If you go beyond the parameters, I am not going to allow the time of the House to be wasted. We are responsible to this House. I cannot allow the time of this House to be wasted like this.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : You had agreed in the morning and I gave you the list of the speakers. I gave you the names.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : But the Members went out of the purview, they went beyond the parameters...

It is not my fault.

SHRI VIRENDRA VERMA : What is your ruling on my point or order ?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : If the debate has gone on, it is not my fault. I gave you the list of speakers.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Gurupadaswamy, you came to me as Leader of the Opposition...

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : Yes, and I gave you the list of names of the speakers who were going to speak. You agreed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : But they did not abide by the rules, by the parameters. At this rate I am not going to allow.

श्री लाल कृष्ण आडवाणी : ज्यादती करें मंत्री जी और सजा दें सदन को ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: If others had not obeyed, why should you punish us ?

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI : It is the Minister who has violated the parameters. And you are punishin the whole House ? Why should we be punished for it ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Everybody violated it.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : No, we have not violated it. You check up the record.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : You agreed in the morning. Please don't go back on that understanding.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI : Madam Deputy Chairman...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : They are going out of the rules. Let them come and discuss the report. Why do they go back on that ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please sit down, Mr. Madan Bhatia.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI : Madam...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Madam, you cannot probably expect Mr. L. K. Advani to follow in the footsteps of Mr. Bhajan Lal. You should listen to Mr. Advani...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Mr. Advani is a cultured and seasoned parliamentarian unlike Bhajan Lal. How can you stop him ?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : Madam, I gave you the list of speakers who were going to speak. Why are you going back on that understanding ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN ; Let me know who is speaking on whose behalf.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : I gave you the list of names, of the persons who were going to speak and you agreed. It is not as of you did not agree.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : They were absent when the report was being discussed. Why did they go back at that time ? If they want to speak, they must first come and discuss the report...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Please sit down, Mr. Madan Bhatia...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : He has been nominated for his supposed eminence.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN ; Please sit down.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA ; You are breaking your promise. You had agreed to give a chance to every leader. How can you go back on it ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I gave a promise and I wanted others also to keep their promise.

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : We will certainly keep it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I do not know what you would speak. We cannot keep on experimenting. I allowed more people...

SHRI CHATURANAN MISHRA : But you permitted them, not us.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : We discussed this matter with you and I told you who were going to speak on our behalf. And you have agreed, graciously agreed.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : No, they cannot be permitted like this...

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA (Rajasthan) : Mr. Madan Bhatia, you can't hold the House to ransom.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Madam, you had permitted so many people. These three nice people have been left out.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : That really makes me laugh, Mr. Upendra. You said, these three nice people have been left out. Then does it mean that the other people were bad people !

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : Please give me two minutes.

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : आपके पास तो फहरिस्त है । . . . **(व्यवधान)**

उप सभापति : चतुरानन मिश्र जी, आप मेरी बात तो सुनिये ।

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : हम तो बैठे ही रह जाते हैं, यह दुर्भाग्य है । . . . **(व्यवधान)**

उपसभापति : आप जरा एक मिनट मेरी बात सुनिए ।

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : जो हल्ला-गुल्ला करें उनको तो आप कहें नहीं और हम अगर बैठे रह गए तो आप पनिश कर देते हैं । . . . **(व्यवधान)**

उपसभापति : हल्ला-गुल्ला करने वालों को बिल्कुल नहीं दिया ।

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : जो पुत्री, पुत्रवधु किसका-किसका नाम ले उसको तो आपने एलाउ कर दिया और जिसने किसी का नाम नहीं लिया उसको पनिश कर दिया ।

उप सभापति : वह तो देखिए कांग्रेस पार्टी की तरफ से जिन्होंने जो नाम दिए वह तो बोलेंगे, वह मेरे अख्तियार में नहीं है । जो सबसे सीनियर हैं उनको मैंने एलाउ किया । . . . **(व्यवधान)**

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Please call them. There are only three or four people left. Let them finish

SHRI JASWANT SINGH ; Madam Deputy Chairman. . . *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Please allow them. Only three or four people are left . . . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : Madam, only two minutes I want. Today is the last day for me. Kindly permit me. . . . *(Interruptions)*. . . .

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Madam, you gave certain indulgence. It was because of your kindness, your magnanimity and indulgence that this came about. Now you have seen what the outcome of this is. . . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA ; How can he say about the outcome ? Who is he to judge the outcome ? He is no judge. . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : It is for everyone to see. . . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : A man who does not know the language he is using cannot talk about the outcome. . *(Interruptions)*. . . A person who does not know the language he uses against the CAG cannot talk about the outcome. . . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : Why are you worried about the CAG ? The CAG cannot look after himself ? . . . *(Interruptions)*. . . Madam. I would request you to kindly tell us how much more time it is going to take.

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : Only two minutes I want, Madam. . . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : How long are you going to allow?. . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : He cannot decide about the outcome...(*interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I request everybody to sit down.

SHRI M.S. GURUPADASWAMY : Please do not break the promise, Madam. Please do not break the promise, our understanding. There are only three Memers and they have got to be called...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Who are the three Members?

SHRI VIRENDRA VERMA: Jaswant Singji, Mishraji and Mr. Aruna..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : In that case, we have also to be called... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI VIRENDRA VERMA: For Mr. Aladi Aruna, today is the last day...(*Interruptions*)...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Who are the three Members?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Mr. Jaswant Singh, Mr. Mishra and Mr. Aruna, and then others.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN ; I will not allow each and every Member to make a speech...(*Interruptions*) ... I will not allow each and every Member to make a speech and that was the understanding Mr. Gurupadaswamy gave me.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Not every Member. I said, "the leader." I gave the names of leaders who are going to speak. That is the understanding and I stand by that and I am not going back o that understanding. But I would request you also not to go back on that understanding. The BJP has to be called; the CPI is to be called Mr. Aruna is here.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Mr. Aruna is retiring today and so, he is to be called.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, there is a one-member party here, two-member party and so on and if you want to discuss it, I have no objection.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI : For Mr. Aladi Aruna, today is the last day in this House.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Don't say today is the last day. We wish that he comes back. He may come back after some time.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Madam the understanding was that the leader of each group would be allowed to speak for two or three minutes. This could have been completed by this time. You are talking about sticking to the parameters. You are in the Chair. So, if anybody crosses the parameters you have to stop him. Mr. Bhajan Lal was not stopped. Mr. Bhajan Lal being a Minister, had crossed the parameters. But for that, why are you punishing the other leaders of the Groups?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nobody is punished...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Why do you punish others? (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am not punishing. I am being punished for being good and allowing the discussion. I could have very easily told Mr. Gurupadaswamy that this is a matter of the other House and so we are not discussing it. I could have taken refuge behind that. But I allowed. Don't take advantage of my goodness. How long a speach everbody has made, both sides. We cannot go on like this . We have already wasted two hours on this What is the result of this? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: Don't say 'wasted.' How can you say 'wasted'?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You don't understand the running of the House. We have a list of business We have to go with it. Whatever business is listed we have to go through it.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: An extraordinary situation has come.

SHRI M. M. JACOB : You have already called for the Short Duration Discussion. You have already called the name. How can you go back on it again? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SYED SIBTEY RAZI (Uttar Pradesh): On a point of order. In this House for the last two hours only one thing is going on. Under rule 242..(*Interruptions*) The Opposition cannot have an upper hand like this. They are casting aspersions. (*Interruptions*) Your previous ruling is worthwhile . You should stand by it. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA : Each Member is giving an opinion on your ruling. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: What is this? (*Interruptions*) It is not a Tis Hazari Court. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA : As the House knows, no single Member can arrogate to himself and give an adjective and judgment whether something going on in this House is irrelevant or not. It s for the House to decide. It is for the Chairman to decide. No Member has a right to talk about it. Therefore, I object to it. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I have given my ruling. No more discussion on it. I have already called Mr. Salve.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Salve.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No. no. We will not allow. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: You stand by your promise. (*Interruptions*) You cannot go back. You must allow others to speak. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Madam, ... (*Interruptions*) the discussion which you have allowed relating to the resignation...(*Interruptions*)

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, no. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Some points were raised. One of the points raised was... (*Interruptions*)

They are reducing Parliament to a bazaar place.(*Interruptions*)

They are heaping indignity upon indignity on the House.

(*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned for ten minutes.

The House then adjourned at twenty-one minutes past four of the clock.

The House re-assembled at thrity four minutes past four of the clock, **The Deputy Chairman** in the Chair.

RE. RESIGNATION BY OPPOSITION MEMBERS FROM LOK SABHA—*Contd.*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Now, I think the tempers are cooled. What we discussed in the morning was Leaders. So, I will allow the Leaders. And Mr. Aladi Aruna is retiring today. As a special consideration we can allow him.

THE MINISTER OF STEEL AND MINES (SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTEDAR) : If anybody else wants to resign, he can be allowed to speak.

(Interruptions)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : Madam Deputy Chairman, my esteemed colleague, Mr. Chaturanan Mishra has to go. I do not mind if he speaks first and I am asked to speak last.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: All right. Mr. Aruna, let Mr. Chaturanan Mishra speak first.

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : मैं ज्यादा समय नहीं लूंगा ।

श्री भजन लाल : महोदय, मेरा सेंटेंस तो पूरा नहीं हुआ । अभी बात बाकी रह गई है । अभी कह दूंगा दो मिनट बाद में बोल लूंगा ।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let Mr. Chaturanan Mishra speak. Then you can speak.

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : उपसभापति महोदया, अपने देश में एक असाधारण घटना घटी है कि हमारे लोकसभा के बहुत से माननीय सदस्यों ने इस्तीफा दे दिया । यह बहुत ही दुखद बात है । इस तरह की घटना घटी है इससे हो सकता है कि शासक पार्टी के कुछ लोगों को आनन्द मिलता हो लेकिन हम लोग समझते हैं हमारे देश के लिए यह अच्छी बात नहीं है । दोनों तरफ के माननीय सदस्य सी. एण्ड ए. जी. की रिपोर्ट पर विभाजित है (व्यवधान) हम लोगों की स्ट्रांग फीलिंग है कि सी० एंड ए०जी० की जो रिपोर्ट आयी है इस पर सदन में बहस नहीं होनी चाहिए । इस पर कारंवाई होनी चाहिए और प्रधान मंत्री को इस्तीफा देना चाहिए । इसी तरह उधर के माननीय सदस्यों का ख्याल है ऐसा नहीं होना चाहिए । जब ऐसी स्थिति है तो विपक्ष ने एक सुझाव दिया है कि हम लोगों का सबका मालिक जनता है इसलिए जनता के पास जाना चाहिए और इसीलिए विपक्ष की पार्टियों ने स्वयं इस्तीफा दे दिया कि अब हम लोग अपने मालिक के पास चलें और फैसला वह दे उसको हम माने । अब शासक पार्टी . . .

श्रीमती वीणा वर्मा (मध्य प्रदेश) : आप क्यों नहीं दे रहे हैं ?

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : मैं उसी पर आ रहा हूं । आप घबरा क्यों रही हैं । यही तो आपके साथ दिक्कत है ? यदि ऐसा न होता तो यह विपत्ति न आती । हमने शुरू में ही कहा था कि बोफोर्स पर यह पार्टी सती क्यों हो रही है । आप इसे आना सती होना न समझें तो हम क्या कहें ? जब आप पूछती है कि आप क्यों इस्तीफा नहीं दे रहे हैं तो मैं इसका भी जवाब दे दूं हमने सुना है कि प्रधान मंत्री जापान, अमेरिका और साइप्रस जाने वाले हैं क्योंकि वहां के नेताओं ने बुलाया है । उनका कहना है कि हम लोगों ने तो एक ही भ्रष्टाचार किया है उसमें हमारी सरकार गिर गयी और इसमें आप कौन ऐसा जादू जानते हो कि इतना करप्शन करने के बाद भी .... (व्यवधान)

श्री गुलाम रसूल मट्टू : गलत आरोप मत लगाइये । (व्यवधान)

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : Madam, once again we are descending to the same level of muddle politics by the permission which you have granted to the hon. Member. (*Interruptions*) There is no reasons why the permission should have been granted.

उपसभापति : मिश्रा जी आप अपनी बात कहिये, हम लोगों को जापान और ईरान मत भेजिए । (व्यवधान)

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : जब प्रधान मंत्री इन देशों से वापस आयेंगे तब हम लोग आपके इस सवाल पर कि हम लोग भी इस्तीफा दें विचार करेंगे . . . (व्यवधान) हम इस सवाल पर विचार कर रहे हैं कि क्या करना चाहिए . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री माखन लाल फोतेदार : मेरा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है । (व्यवधान)

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : मैं दो मिनट में खत्म करता हूं । (व्यवधान)

SHRI MAKHAN LAL FOTEDAR : Madam, on a point of information. My humble submission is that you have permitted him to speak on some subject which is not relevant to the House. I would request them, through you, that they should not make any personal attack. If and when any personal attack is made, it should not be allowed to be recorded.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : This I have requested.

SHRI CHATURNAN MISHRA : I have not made any personal attack. I only wanted to know, when he is going to resign. (*Interruptions*)

कुछ माननीय सदस्यों ने सवाल उठाया है कि हम लोग जो प्रधान मंत्री को हटाने के लिए कह रहे हैं और वह जो प्रगतिशील विधेयक आने वाले हैं जैसे पंचायती राज बिल उसे रोकने के लिए कह रहे हैं । . . . (व्यवधान) अगर ये माननीय सदस्य गारन्टी करें इस सदन में आपके सामने कि पंचायती बिल को अगर हम लोग पास कर देंगे तो प्रधान मंत्री इस्तीफा दे देंगे . . . (व्यवधान)

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह : प्रधान मंत्री इस्तीफा दे दें बहुत बढ़िया बात है । अच्छा काम भी करें और प्रधान मंत्री इस्तीफा भी दें । कहां चली गयी है आपकी बुद्धि . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री भजन लाल : मेरा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है । इनकी नीयत से साफ जाहिर है कि पंचायती राज की वजह से और नगर पालिकाओं की वजह से इनको कितनी तकलीफ हो रही है और जवाहर रोजगार योजना की वजह से कितनी तकलीफ हो रही है इनके पास कोई बस नहीं है इसलिए इस बात को उठा रहे हैं । (व्यवधान)

श्री यशवन्त सिन्हा : मैं जानना चाहता हूं इसमें क्या प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है । (व्यवधान)

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : मैंने पंचायती बिल का नाम लिया । अगर नगर पालिकाओं के बिल के बारे में भी कहते हैं तो हम उसको भी पास कर देंगे । . . . (व्यवधान) . . . आप गारन्टी करवा दीजिए कि प्रधान मंत्री इस्तीफा देंगे । (व्यवधान)

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह : महोदया, इनकी नियत साफ मालूम होती है कि पंचायती राज के द्वारा हिन्दुस्तान की जनता को सत्ता नहीं देनी चाहिए और जो पावर्स हैं वे नहीं देने चाहिए ।

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : हम तो हिन्दुस्तान की जनता को सत्ता देने के लिए बिना विरोध के कानून पास कर देंगे, लेकिन आप भी अनकंडीशनली प्रधान मंत्री से रिजाइन करवा दीजिये । अगर आपकी डेमोक्रेटिक पार्टी है तो आप यह काम करवा दीजिये । . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री पशुपति नाथ ठाकुर (उत्तर प्रदेश) : क्या आप राज्य सभा से भी इस्तीफा देंगे ?

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : आने दीजिये प्रधान मंत्री को जापान और अमरीका से घूमकर . . . (व्यवधान)

श्री पशुपति नाथ ठाकुर : आप राज्य सभा से इस्तीफा दीजिये ।

श्री चतुरानन मिश्र : विपक्ष ने आपको चेलेंज किया है कि जनता सबसे बड़ी है, जनता के सामने जाकर उसकी राय लीजिये, यही मुझे आपसे कहना है ।

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : Madam Deputy Chairman, vociferously and repeatedly hon. Members on the other side have termed this day as a very unique day. That is their yardstick. They have termed a day as unique which veritably is a day of betrayal for the democracy of India. This is a day which has witnessed total flouting of democratic norms and a farce being played with the people

of the country. Such an occasion perhaps could have been termed unique if Mr. Ramakrishna Hedge had resigned on the arrack scandal and before he was forced to quit on the telephone tapping matter. (*Interruptions*). Such a day could have been perhaps unique had NTR resigned when he was indicted by the High court and such a day could have perhaps been termed unique if Jyoti Basu had resigned on the Bengal Lamp matter. (*Interruptions*).

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Why can't you listen? It is very unfortunate that you come inside the Chamber and say that everybody is going to listen quietly. Now when somebody is speaking, why can't you listen? Let the people know what is right and what is wrong. (*Interruptions*). I did not listen. Let me listen.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: But since when has it been decided that asking for resignation of a person of an elected body is flouting the norms of democracy?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : We do not want comments. Please sit down.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : Madam, the oppsition is so reckless today that it had never experienced such a desperation before. For over two years we have seen a concerted campaign being launched to destabilise a duly elected Government. All sorts of innuendoes were raised and a sort of disaffection was sought to be created in the minds of the people. Very recently it has come to our notice that an hon. Member of the other side, when he went abroad and made common cause with those people who were out to wreck the unity and integrity of the country, none spoke from the other side.

Madam, much hue and cry has been raised over the issue relating to Bofors. I won't like to go into its details, but I do want to point out that it was the Joint Parliamentary Committee which went into the matter in detail and on the basis of incontrovertible evidence came to the conclusion that it was a best buy because of the situation prevailing, because of the counter bombaredment capacity acquired by a neighbouring country under a hostile Government. Madam, once again this report of the Comptroller and Auditor-General of India has provided some psychotropic substance to our friends and once again we witness that euphoria.

[*The Vice Chairman (Shri Jagesh* Desai) in the Chair]

Little do they know that not even a word has been said against the Prime Minister in that Report. Except wild allegations, no vertiable evidence was either offered or pointed to. And what we witness today, or what they are feeling very proud about is ex-mass resignation of the Opposition Members in the Lok Sabha. Various reasons have been given by them. But if you were to go into it candidly, you would find that they were baffled by the success the Rajiv Gandhi Government had made in the country. They were totally dumbfounded by the popularity that the Prime Minister's programmes had gained.

Sir, having sensed that with the move to give power to the Panchayati Raj system and thereby to the people, nothing would be left in the armoury of the opposition, they were feeling very shaky. They tried all sorts of gimmicks and now to find a scapegoat, they have tendered their resignations. They have tendered their resignations because their activities over the last five days had lowered their image in the minds of the people. The people of the country had realised that the Opposition only stands to hold the Parliament to ransom, that the Opposition has no respect for the Parliamentary form of govern-

[Shri Pawan Kumar Bansal]

ment. To salvage their position, they have recklessly tried to give a picture that they stand for value-based politics. Very recklessly they have made all sorts of allegations, but they forget that it was Prime Minister Rajiv Gandhi who tried to cleanse the public life by bringing about the Anti-Defection Bill, which they have challenged in the courts, challenged to induce people from one party to come over to another party, challenged because they want the right to overthrow a duly elected government. Having failed to do all that, they have tried to point a picture of being paragons of virtue today.

Sir, only one thing I want to add. The resignations in the Lok Sabha are meaningless. If we were to go by the attendance of the so-called leaders, Mr. V.P. Singh and Mr. Arun Nehru, we would know that these two leaders hve hardly attended sessions of the Lok Sabha. They are busy intriguing outside, intriguing to overthrow this Government and having failed to do so, this is another resort—a resort which is part of a bigger chain of conspiracies being hatched to destabilise the country. Sir, I say so with full sense of responsibility.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY (Uttar Pradesh) : Then you must admit that you were wrong in giving them important positions in the Government earlier.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : The moment anything was realised, the moment their activities were unearthed, they had no place in the Congress. The only place they found was as leaders of the Opposition.

Sir, finally, I want to say that the hue and cry over Bofors has been raised by those vested interests who could not bag the contract from Government of India. If at all there was any fault of the Government of India led by Mr. Rajiv Gandhi, it was that he tried to save money for the country and he saved money to the extent of about Rs. 200 crores. This is perhaps what is not platable to our friends on the other side. Maybe they would have been happy if Khashoggi had managed to get this contract.

Sir, the Government has ever vigilant and will remain vigilant. A motley of Opposition groups who have lost credibility with the people has no moral right to demand the resignation of a government which is duly elected.

The people of India elected Rajiv Gandhi and the Members of the Congress in Lok Sabha for a period of five years. With a massive majority the Congress Members returned to the Lok Sabha, and unanimously they elected Rajiv Gandhi as their leader. The people are sovereign, I agree, and we are prepared to go and would go to the court of the people at the right time. It is only the Opposition which has been shaky on occasions. At times they said that the elections would be postponed. At times they said that there would be a snap poll. Having failed to come together, having failed to come together on one platform, this is their last resort. But, I am sure, Sir, this, for them, is the swan song.

Thank you, Sir.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, since I retire today, I thank the Chair and other honourable Members of this House for their kindness, hospitality and cooperation during my service here.

Sir, at the outset I congratulate all the honourable Members of Parliament who have resigned today as a protest against the failure of this Government to respect and honour the observations and findings of the CAG's report. When I

submitted my note of dissent on the report of the Joint Parliamentary Committee, I was alleged by the ruling party Members...

SHRI P.N. SUKUL : Prepared by whom?

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : Prepared by the Great Aladi Aruna! The Treasury Benches said that the report was politically motivaged and it was due to the political climate in Tamil Nadu.

Mr. Vice-Chairman, I would like to remind the House that whatever I have observed, whatever I have found, whatever I have written in my note of dissent has been duly strengthened and confirmed in the CAG's report on the last page.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : We are not discussing the report.

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : Why? What is wrong? Whatever I have oberved has been corroborated and confirmed in the CAG's report. Is there anything unparliamentary in this? What is this? You were patiently hearing whatever they were saying.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : He is not going into the details. He is only saying... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : When the report of the Swedish National Audit Bureau compelled the Government...

(*Interruptions*)...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : No, I will not allow you. Be within the the parameters. I can't allow you, no.

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह : मेरा प्वाइंट आफ आर्डर है, माइक काम नहीं कर रहा है।

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : The CAG's report has paved the way for the fall of this Government.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : This is a very limited issue.

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : Mr. Anand Sharma, while he spoke, alleged that Mr. V.P. Singh also was responsible for the award of the contract in the Bofors deal.

SHRI ANAND SHARMA : Exclusively responsible, let me correct you.

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : My point is, since I have gone through all the relevant files and the necessary records, I would like to inform this House that as far as the Bofors gun deal is concerned, it was dealt with absolutely by the Defence Ministery.

THE VICE CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : I will not allow you, no .

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNCHALAM : Why?

THE VICE CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : I am sitting in the Chair. I will not allow you, no.

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM :*

SHRI M. M. JACOB : Sir, it should be expunged. Otherwise there is no point in disallowing... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM : *

---

*Not recorded.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : This will not go on record.

SHRI ALADI ARUNA *alias* V. ARUNACHALAM :*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Shri Mirza Irshadbaig. Be within the parameters, please.

SHRI MIRZA IRSHADBAIG (Gujarat) : Yes, definitely.

THE VICE-CHAIRMA (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : And nobody else from the Opposition now.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Why? How do you draw this line?

THE VICE CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : No.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : What do you mean by "No?"...(*Interruptions*)...

AN HONOURABLE MEMBER ; He is a Member of the Janata Party.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : No, I cannot allow everybody.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : How have you drawn the line? I would like to speak on behalf of the the Janata Party.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : I was told by the Deputy Chairman that only two more Members were to be allowed.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Why? After all, you have allowed so many(...*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Mr. Irshadbaig, not more than five minutes, please.

*Not recorded.

SHRI MIRZA IRSHADBAIG : Okay, I will try my level best to conclude within that time.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Thank you.

श्री मीर्जा इर्शादबेग : मान्यवर, उपसभापक्ष महोदय, आज जैसा कि चतुरानन मिश्र जी कहते थे कि एक ऐतिहासिक घटना घटी है, मैं इसका समर्थन करता हूं, क्योंकि अलोकतांत्रिक मांग के आधार पर, अलोकतांत्रिक प्रक्रिया को हाथ में लेकर यह निर्णय लेना और लोगों के चुने हुए प्रतिनिधित्व की हैसियत से गैरजिम्मेदारी पूर्वक अपने आपको प्रस्तुत करना, मैं समझता हूं कि देश में इससे पूर्व इतना हताश और इतना कमजोर विपक्ष कभी नहीं रहा, जो अपनी जिम्मेदारियों से मुकर कर भाग गया हो और जिसने देश के लोगों को धोखा दिया हो।

माननीय गुरुपदस्वामी जी ने चर्चा के प्रारम्भ में तीन मुद्दों पर अपनी बातों को कहा था। मैं इन तीन मुद्दों को अपने वक्तव्य में सम्मिलित करना चाहता हूं। उन्होंने पहली बात यह कही कि देश में एक पोलिटिकल क्राइसिस खड़ी हुई है, दूसरी बात यह कही कि वर्तमान सरकार के पास मोरेलिटी नहीं है और तीसरी बात यह कही थी कि राजीव गांधी ने जिस दिन सत्ता के सूत्र को संभाला था उस दिन देश की जनता को यह वचन दिया था कि एक क्लीन एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन देंगे। मैं इन तीनों मुद्दों को आपके समक्ष प्रस्तुत करते हुए उनसे यह पूछना चाहूंगा कि इन तीन मुद्दों के संदर्भ में अपने आपको जरा टटोलकर देखें।

जहां तक सी० एण्ड ए०जी० की रिपोर्ट का प्रश्न है मैं पूछना चाहता हूं कि एक शब्द इसके बारे में मुझे बताइये कि कहीं पर राजीव गांधी के खिलाफ या उनकी सरकार के खिलाफ कहा है या कोई भ्रष्टाचार का मामला दिया है। देश के किसी भी कोर्ट को ले लीजिए, हाई कोर्ट को ले लीजिए मैं पूछना चाहता

हूं कि क्या किसी भी हाईकोर्ट ने राजीव गांधी के खिलाफ या उनकी सरकार के खिलाफ यह साबित किया है या स्ट्रिक्चर्स पास किये हैं कि कहीं पर भ्रष्टाचार या घोटाला हुआ है। मैं माननीय गुरुपदस्वामी जी से यह पूछना चाहता हूं। आपकी ऐसी गैरजिम्मेदारी भारत के इतिहास में कहीं नहीं है।...(व्यवधान) यह तो आप कहते हैं...(व्यवधान) कमेटी में हम थे। कमेटी में आपको बुलाया क्या था। इससे बड़ी गैरजिम्मेदारी क्या हो सकती है वर्मा जी कि जब अपने तथ्यों को साबित करने के लिए आपकी मांग पर, हमारी मांग पर नहीं, ज्वाइंट पार्लियामेंटरी कमेटी बनाई। इससे बड़ी गैरजिम्मेदारी क्या हो सकती है। क्योंकि आपको पता था कि हकीकत कुछ और है और आप लोग कहते कुछ और जा रहे हैं और हकीकत साबित नहीं कर सकते थे जो आप कहते हैं, इसी वजह से 5.00 P.M. आप समिति में शामिल नहीं हुए।

इसी वजह से आप समिति में शामिल नहीं हुए और इसी वजह से वह जिम्मेदारी आप लेना नहीं चाहते हैं। वह समिति जिसमें विपक्ष के कुछ लोग मौजूद थे यह अलादो अरुण जी भी शुरू-शुरू में कुछ और थे और बाद में न जाने किसी पढ़ी हुई नोट उन्होंने पढ़ी थी, लेकिन मैं यह पूछना चाहता हूं कि समिति ने अपनी रिपोर्ट दी है, मैं यह चाहता हूं कि सत्य देश के सामने आए उस वक्त भी विपक्ष से कहा गया था कि इस कमेटी में आप शामिल होइए और विपक्ष शामिल नहीं हुआ। राजीव गांधी ने तो कहा था, कांग्रेस की सरकार ने तो कहा था कि आप आइये और तथ्यों का पता लगाइये। जो डाकूमेंट्स हमने देखे हैं वे तमाम डाकूमेंट्स आपको देखने की इजाजत थी, किंतु आप उसके अन्दर शामिल नहीं हुए। आज सी.ए.जी. ने कुछ अपने तथ्य उसमें दिए हैं हम यह जानना चाहते हैं कि अगर तथ्यों में कोई बात है तो आइये, बैठ करके हम बात-चीत करना चाहते हैं, लेकिन इससे आप क्यों मुकरते हैं, आप इसकी चर्चा से क्यों मुकरते हैं? मान्यवर, यह इसलिए मुकरते हैं कि उनके पास लोगों के पास जा करके आगामी चुनाव में कहने को कोई बात नहीं है जिससे लोगों का विश्वास उनमें समर्पित हो। मान्यवर, आज जो कार्यक्रम राजीव गांधी और उनकी कांग्रेस सरकार ने दिए हैं इससे साबित हो चुका है और आज यह बात कर रहे हैं लोगों के पास हम और आप जायेंगे कितने दिवस की बात थी? उन्होंने ऐसा निर्णय क्यों लिया, जो मूल में घातक निर्णय है? लोगों के द्वारा जो दी गई जिम्मेदारी थी उसको निभाने का आपने वायदा किया था। उस वायदे को आपने भूलने की बात की है। बोफोर्स की बात कर रहे हैं, मान्यवर, जसवंत सिंह जी यहां पर हैं, अगर यह चाहते हैं कि जो-जो मुद्दे सी.ए.जी. ने उठाए हैं उस पर हम बहस करते...(व्यवधान) मैं यही कहता हूं कि इसकी हम चर्चा करते लेकिन ये चर्चा करने के लिए भी तैयार नहीं है। मान्यवर, बोफोर्स, की बात कर रहे हैं और अभी कह रहे थे कि लोग आपको बता देंगे। मान्यवर, एक ही बात मैं आपको उजागर करना चाहता हूं, माननीय जसवंत सिंह जी यहां पर हैं, मान्यवर, मैं अभी राजस्थान गया था...(व्यवधान) जो मुझे कहा गया है उससे आगे नहीं बोलूंगा। आपकी तरह ज्यादा नहीं बोलूंगा। मान्यवर, मैं अभी राजस्थान के दौरे पर था। राजस्थान की मारवाड़ी, भाषा तो मैं बहुत जानता नहीं हूं किन्तु जब रात को मैं रास्ते से गुजर रहा था तब मुझे भी, क्योंकि देश में इन लोगों ने और मीडिया के आधार से जो देश के लोगों में एक भाषा भ्रमण पैदा की है तो मुझे भी लगा कि कम से कम जांच तो लूं कि गांव की जो ग्रामीण जनता है जो करोड़ों में है...(व्यवधान)

श्री पर्वतनेनि उपेन्द्र: मीडिया आपका है।

श्री मीर्जा इर्शादबेग: वह तो देखिए आपको पता लगेगा। मैं जा करके आया हूं और लोगों से मिल करके आया हूं। गांव के जो लोग बैठे थे मैंने उनसे पूछा, शायद मैंने कहा कि विरोधी दलों ने जो बात लोगों के दिलों में बैठाई है जरा पूछूं तो सही कि हकीकत क्या है। जब वह गांव के लोग बैठे तो मैंने उनसे जाकर

[श्री मीर्जा इर्शादबेग]

पूछा था, मैंने उनकी भाषा में थोड़ी-बहुत जानकारी में लाने की कोशिश की, मैंने पूछा कि भाई, कहीं यह बात सुनिया है, कुछ बोफोर्स-बोफोर्स वाली बात चली है देश में, तो कोई बात सुनी थे?

उप सभाध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश देसाई): गुड मारवाड़ी।

श्री मीर्जा इर्शादबेग: तो मान्यवर, उन्होंने यह कहा कि भाई, छापा-वापा तो काई वचया से, पर एक बात जरूर है, तुम तो दिल्ली से आया है, तुमको एक बात जरूर बता दिओ, हमने सुना है लोगा बात करता से, हमने सुना है कि राजीव गांधी को बर्फी खूब भावे तो राजीव गांधी क्या लाखों रुपया की बर्फी खावे है? मैंने कहा, भाई, बोफोर्स तो इनके दिल में बर्फी ही है। तो इनका जो भ्रामक प्रचार है वह प्रचार वहां तक पहुंचा है। मैंने जब उनसे यह पूछा कि राजीव गांधी के जवाहर रोजगार कार्यक्रम के बारे में कुछ बात आई है तो उन्होंने कहा, भाई, हमारा सरपंच से लाखों रुपया का चैक पहली बार आवे है और राजीव गांधी ने पहली बार हमको यह बात कही है कि आपको हमको एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन में वैभट में हमको शामिल किया है। अब यह बात है, मान्यवर, ... (व्यवधान)

श्री पर्वतनेनि उपेन्द्र: 6 महीने में सब पता लग जाएगा।

श्री मीर्जा इर्शादबेग: आइये, उपेन्द्र जी, मैं आपसे पूछना चाहता हूं, यह निर्णय तो आप और मैं नहीं करेंगे, यह निर्णय तो देश की जनता करेगी।

उप सभाध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश देसाई): अब आप खत्म कीजिए।

श्री मीर्जा इर्शादबेग: दो मिनट में खत्म करता हूं। पंचायती राज वाला जो मामला लाए हैं उसको देश की जनता तय करेगी।... (व्यवधान)

श्री पर्वतनेनि उपेन्द्र: वाइस चेयरमैन साहब, यह सब कहानी प्राइम मिनिस्टर को मिसलीड कर रहे हैं।

ठाकुर जगपाल सिंह: ये लोग सुनना नहीं चाहते, इस्तीफा मांगते हैं।

श्री मीर्जा इर्शादबेग: मान्यवर, मैं यही देख रहा था कि चूंकि अभी-अभी, अब हम से उन्होंने यह कहा है देश के लोगों से यह कह रहे हैं कि हम एक हो करके, तमाम विपक्ष एक हो करके, क्योंकि सी.ए.जी. की रिपोर्ट में ऐसा है, अभी लोगों ने कहा, इस वजह से हम तमाम विरोधी दल एक हो करके कांग्रेस के सामने लड़ना चाहते हैं ... (व्यवधान)

एक माननीय सदस्य: क्योंकि जनता के सामने वह अकेले तो जा नहीं सकते, इसलिये साथ मिल कर जाने की कोशिश कर रहे हैं, फिर भी वह जीत नहीं सकेंगे।

श्री मीर्जा इर्शादबेग: लेकिन मुझे संशय तो हुआ था कि अगर यह सब मिल करके आयेंगे तो शायद हमको ज्यादा मेहनत करनी पड़ेगी, परिश्रम करना पड़ेगा, लेकिन मान्यवर, अभी मैंने देखा आज उप सभापति महोदया ने विरोधी दल के नेता को यह कहा कि आप में से कोई तीन व्यक्तियों को आप चुनने के लिये कहें तो 3 की जगह पर 10 खड़े हो गये। अब यही मामला है विरोध के साथ। आडवाणी जी का एक निवेदन भी पढ़ा, वह जनता दल के बारे में उन्होंने यह कहा है कि जनता दल बिखर रहा है... (व्यवधान)

उप सभाध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश देसाई): इसके साथ कोई ताल्लुक नहीं है।

श्री मीर्जा इर्शादबेग: मैं तो यह कहना चाहता हूं.. (व्यवधान) नहीं यह विकल्प है। तो मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि आज जो घटना बड़ी

है विरोधी दल ने अपनी जिम्मेदारी से मुकर करके उसने जो इस्तीफे दिये हैं, आप जानते हैं कि यह देश के प्रजातंत्र की जो प्रणाली है उस पर सब से बड़ा कुठाराघात है और वह अपनी जिम्मेदारी से मुकर गये हैं। मान्यवर, मैं चाहता हूं कि आकर यहां बैठें और सी.ए.जी. की रिपोर्ट पर हम चर्चा करने के लिये तैयार हैं। हमने कभी सच्चाई से मुंह नहीं मोड़ा। बोफोर्स की जब कमेटी बनाई तब हमने कहा था कि हम तथ्य देंगे और वही लोग हैं वहां जा करके बैठे हैं और मान्यवर, उनमें संशय आज भी है। मान्यवर, मैं आपके माध्यम से उनको कहना चाहता हूं कि जो कार्यक्रम कांग्रेस ने दिये हैं, जो कार्यक्रम राजीव गांधी ने दिये है, आइये, क्यों आपने वोट नहीं किया 15 दिन के लिये, यह आपकी नैतिकता है, क्यों आपने यहां पर इस्तीफा नहीं दिया ? उपेन्द्र जी यह कह रहे हैं, क्योंकि हम तो डाइरेक्टली इलेक्टेड नहीं हैं, लेकिन आप प्रजा के प्रतिनिधि ऐसे नहीं तो ऐसे तो हैं। आपको सीधे नहीं चुना है तो आपको परोक्ष रूप से तो चुना है। इसलिये अगर आप मुकर रहे हैं कि आप प्रजा के प्रतिनिधि नहीं हैं तो वह आपको मुबारक हो। मैं यही कहना चाहता हूं मान्यवर, एक गिरी हुई राजनीति को आधार बना कर देश के विरोधी दलों ने आज जो निर्णय किया है, इसे देश की जनता मुआफ नहीं करेगी और आने वाले दिनों में दूध का दूध और पानी का पानी करके जनता आपको दिखलायेगी। धन्यवाद।

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, on a day when in effect Parliament is incomplete, when a large number of our colleagues from the other place have taken the extreme stand of resigning their membership of it, I am saddened that some senior Members of the Treasury Benches ought to have referred to them as "Charlie" and "Jokers" and ought to have referred to their resignation as a "Circus" or a "Nautanki" or a "drama". I am especially aggrieved at the attitude of the ruling party to an event which to my mind is of unprecedented importance. This approach which the ruling party has just demonstrated, of sneering intolerance is indeed at the very root of our current difficulties. Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, Parliament as an instrument, as a representative body, can and indeed is only as effective, or ineffective as the ruling party of the Treasury Benches are sensitive to the urgent, current, concerns of the minority. When the grievance redressal system of Parliament gets choked and clogged and when the majority becomes insensitive to the concerns of the minority, it is then that we come across or we witness a situation like today. I do submit, Sir, that in independent India's history when in the Lower House the entire Opposition, irrespective of which persuasion it is, finds it necessary to leave their seats, it is a political development of unprecedented dimensions which ought to call from us—we are a Council of States, a continuing body, meant to continue despite whatever other difficulties or problems there may be that afflict the rest of the politics of the country——reflection on that development with the deepest of consideration. That is again, Sir, why I am so distressed that the Deputy Leader of the Congress party and a Cabinet Minister of this Government ought to have chosen to deride this development instead of reflecting on the events that have brought it about. Sir, on Thursday last I intervened on a point of order. Well, before coming to it, I do wish to refer to an aspect which I was reminded about by my esteemed colleague and senior, Shri Lalji Advani. Even at the height of late JP's movement in Bihar, when he advised the legislators of Bihar State Assembly to forsake their seats, their membership of the State Assembly, there was questioning of the step that was then proposed. A step has now

[Shri Jaswant Singh]

been taken by our colleagues and brethren who have lived with us in this Parliament for near about the last five years and they have chosen to leave today when within one month from now they could have earned a rightful pension for their labour and it is not behoving for us to deride the step that they have taken. The correct step, the correct attitude would be of reflection. I was referring to the intervention that I had made last Thursday on a point of order. I had then submitted that if we took up for discussion the CAG's report within the Parliament, we would be committing a gross parliamentry impropriety and breaking its convention. I had then cited what I thought were the correct references behind the point I was then making. I am not going to repeat them.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : Sir, if he yields, I have one submission to make.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : If he yields, I have no objection.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL : If I am not mistaken, the question of pension arises only for the people who are having their first term. For others, it is per year that the pension is computed. It is not considered to be an important issue at all. But if at all he refers to it....(*Interruptions*).

THE VICE CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : It applies to first term only.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : It is not a point which I wish to reply to. Sir, I was referring to last Thursday. I had, on that occasion, laid emphasis on the rules and procedures and the conventions and the conduct of the business of the House, etc. and I referred to the aspect of vital importance of not demolishing a pillar of our republic merely because in the performance of his duties, the CAG, without fear or favour, might have embarassed the Government. Sir, the ruling party Members have asserted that the CAG's finding—and the CAG's report is not conjectures, but conclusions, findings—has contained no indictment of the Government.

I am appalled at the sheer shamelessness of the Government. This CAG report, and the conclusions that he has arrived at are treated by the Treasury Benches as not an indictment of the system, of the decision making process or indeed of the congealing of that decision making or the sheer jamming of the decision-making process. Then I do not know what they will find as an indictment. Underlining all that what I had said on Thursday was, I underlined also our difficulty in participating in that discussion, one additional consideration and one apprehension. The consideration was that the Parliament is, at least in theory, the upholder of the Constitution. We cannot, you and I, maintain the magnificent edifice of it if simultaneously we become instruments of destroying the constituents of it, the very brick and mortal of it. Simultaneously while giving verbal support to the Constitution, if we start destroying the constituent elements of it, the Constitution will fall and this republic will be damaged beyond repair. The institutions of our republic have, as indeed any individual has, one sanctuary alone in this country, and they ought to come free of mind and expect that sanctuary to uphold their interest, to look after them, those institutions or that individual. And that sanctuary is the Parliament. And if the Parliament itself were to turn around and start devouring the pillars of the republic, then how are we in the Opposition to become participants in that destructive and farcical exercise? That was an additional consideration which I did not refer to on Thursday. There was also an apprehension, and the apprehension has been

borne out by subsequent events, more than anything else, by the intervention, and I say this with a great deal of sorrow, by the intervention of the deputy leader of the Congress Party. Under the guise of discussing the CAG report, if the ruling party were to utilise that as an opportunity to mount an assault on the office and the functioning and indeed on the person of the Comptroller and Auditor General, I certainly, indeed personally, won't be a party to it and I advise all my colleagues to stop and resist it. Instead of upholding the Constitution we have seen a demonstration by no less than the deputy leader of the ruling party in this House who had deliberately, wilfully, and mindlessly—if he would forgive my saying so—(*Interruptions*) contributed to the destruction of that institution by referring to the person of the Comptroller and Auditor General...

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : Are we discussing the report?

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI : Let him complete. He has not yet completed his submissic.

SHR N.K.P. SALVE : Is he entitled to deal with my arguments without participating in the debate?

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : "Kicked at the bottoms", "If they had kicked him at the bottoms"—this is the kind of language used by Mr. Salve!

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : It is not the language....

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : But I am not yielding.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI : He is not yielding.

SHRI VIRENDRA VERMA : He is not yielding.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : But let him say what he wants to say.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI : But he is not yielding.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : Let me complete my points.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : He has used the word "mindlessly". That is why I allow him.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : But let me complete my sentence. I will yield to you. It distressed me, to give an example, that the deputy leader of the ruling party should refer to the Comptroller and Auditor General as "that Charlie". He went further and said "in Maharashtra Charlies are Chaturvedis"... (*Interruption*) that he should go to the extent of saying "Kicked at the bottoms". I certainly am distressed...(*interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : He has used some word, "mindlessly".

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: It is there on record...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: It is there on record... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): You see, certain epithets have been used and that is why it is my duty to ask Mr. Salve now to speak...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI VIRENDRA VERMA : Let Mr. Jaswant Singh finish first.. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE : It is highly regrettable Sir, I will refer to only one aspect of the matter. I have already stated that in the speech which I made the other day, I could have used a more temperate language, but the manner in which my leader was attacked right, left and centre..(*Interruptions*)..has been totally insane, unjust, unwarranted, and if I may say...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA: How can he say "insane"? How can he use the word "insane"? You objected to the word "mindless". "Insane" is all right?..(*Interruptions*).

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: Suppose I were to criticise the Prime Minister. I could have understood his anger against me. But I cannot justify or retionalise or in any way defend his attack on the Comptroller and Auditor General...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : What is important.. (*Interruptions*)..What is important ..(*Interruptions*)..What is important is not something said by me figuratively, in a figurative way, but the substantive issue I raised and the two substantive issuesI raised were ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : He should apologise for the words he has used ..(*Interruptions*)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: It is a disgrace for Parliament that a senior Member should be saying such things...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : A senior Member has talked like this. He should apologise ..(*Interruptions*)..

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: He has brought disgrace to this House by saying all that by abusing the CAG .(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : He should apologise... ..(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE: Sir, I spoke according to the rules and I did not use any unparliamentary words. Those who have been coming to the well of the House and shouting left, right and centre and heaping all indignities on the Chair and are asking me to apologise are to be ashamed of it..(*Interruptions*)

SOME HON. MEMBERS : You should apologise...(*Interrupti'ons*)

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO : He has been using rotten language during the last three or four days...(*Interruptio ns*)

SHRI B. SATYANARAYAN REDDY : Mr. Salve should apologise...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : He calls a colleague of his as ** and he has the cheek to talk about dignity here?...(*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO : I know he is going to be buried earlier than myself...(*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Please sit down ...(*Interruptions*)...All of you, please sit down...(*Interruptions*)

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA : You are only asking us and you are not telling the other side...(*Interruptions*)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Yes, Mr. Jaswant Singh, you continue now.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH : As I said, the additional consideration was that my apprehension is strengthened every time a Member of the ruling party intervenes and makes a reference to the CAG that the entire exercise of discussing the CAG report is *ab initio* wrong in parliamentary terms, and the correct place for it is the PAC.

This will be utilized, misutilized by the treasury benches merely to mount an attack on the person of the the Comptroller and Auditor-General.

SHRI ANAND SHRMA: Just one clarification, Sir.

---

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

SOME HON. MEMBERS : No, no. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ANAND SHARMA : He is yielding, Sir. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA : You should have asked him whether he is yielding or not.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI); Please sit down. You have not to teach me that. Please sit down. You don't teach me. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: On a point of order. (*Interruptions*) On whose behalf is Mr. Sharma going to give clarification or seek a clarification? On behalf of the C&AG? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ANAND SHARMA : Mr Jaswant Singh has yielded. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. C. LAKSHMANNA : You should have asked him. You did not ask him because you are...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI ANAND SHARMA : It is most unfortunate even that if a reference is made to the C&AG's report in the discussion, it is totally precluded; it cannot be discussed by this House. I will not go into the details whether it can be discussed or not. My point of clarification is this. If that was the case why did his leader, Shri Advani, give notice for a discussion?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): If Mr. Jaswant Singh wants to clarify, he can clarify.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Mr. Vice-Chairman Sir, I knew . I yielded because I wanted to clarify. I am very happy to have yielded, because I wished to clarify whatever doubts the treasury benches might have on the stand that we took. I am indeed very grateful to the hon. Member for having asked this question. It is a question which is a worthy question. We will answer it. I will answer it.

Sir, when I referred to what I have said about the substantive difficulties that we continue to face about permitting a discussion on the C&AG's report and the apprehensions that we had that the opportunity of the discussion will be misutilized by the treasury benches to mount, to my mind, a totally unacceptable assault on the person and the office of the C&AG—I will tell you, Sir, why the leader of my party gave notice for a discussion on the Bofors issue: it was our expectation that the Government will come forward not just with the C&AG's report but an Action Taken Report, that the Government will come forward not with the C&AG's report and ask for a discussion on it but the Government will come forward with the Action Taken Report. (*Interruptions*) It was our expectation that the Government will come forward and give a reply as to why the CBI investigation into the Bofors deal has not been completed till today, that the Government will come forward and tell us why it did not, despite promises on the floor of this House, conclude an agreement with the Government of Switzerland for exchange of vital information, that the Government will come forward and explain to us that when it came to the Swedish Audit Bureau's report why it did not participate in it, and that the Government will come forward with an answer. (*Interruptions*) He asked for a clarification. Don't they want to hear the clarification? Why has the Government permitted Mr. *Win Chadha to leave the* country? He was the principal... (*Interruptions*) it was our expectation...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI ANAND SHARMA: My clarification was on a constitutional point. He maintains that the C.A.G. report cannot be discussed. But

[Shri Anand Sharma]

Shri Advani gave a notice for that. I need a clarification on that

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Why did the leader of my party ask for a discussion. The leader of my party asked for a discussion because it was his expectation that the issue that is involved is much more than Bofors; the issue that is involved is the security of the nation. It is the security of the nation that is involved. It was our expectation that in the face of this mounting, this most damning and cumulative evidence of the greatest scandals involving indeed the very security of the nation, the, ruling party will have a sense of accountability, it will share their sense of accountability with us and sharing it with us it will be faced, indeed with what we are faced with today. Is it not an issue far transcending the issue of who has made what money? Sir, I share my very personal feeling with you. I am bored with who has made how much money. It has already become a matter of some indifference to me. But I may tell you on the floor of this House that for this weapon system the country has had to pay a very heavy price and that price is not in terms of dollers or Swedish kronners or what we are witnessing today. The fact that some members of our community of parliamentarians should have been persuaded to give up being parliamentarians is also a part of that price. Sir, the ruling party...

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Please conclude.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, I will conclude in two or three sentences. Please heed my caution. I appeal to the Treasury Benches and I appeal to you to please heed my caution because we are witnessing the demise, indeed a deliberate assassination, of a great deal that holds this nation together. History is not going to forgive any of us whether you or me. Treasury Benches, quite often are in the habit of mouthing a sentiment. No sacrifice is too great for the nation Well, then I make an appeal, Sir. First of all match your utterances with action. Make just a small sacrifice. Give up your love of office. For the sake of the nation, sacrifice your *kursi*. For the good of India, go depart resign and let India breathe again.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Shri Madan Bhatia. Within the parameters, please. Only 5 or 7 minutes.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir, I have become used to the political and the constitutional homilies which have been delivered by the hon. member of the B.J.P. couched in high-flown verbiage. The hon. member has talked abo ut the Constitution and parliamentary democracy. And he has asked the h on. Members to ponder over the development of resignation from the Lok Sabha of varioius members belonging to the Opposition. Sir, I have been pondering over this development. I have been pondering over this development for the last 16 hours, ever since I came to know about this development.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: What a great job!

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: If there is one thing which becom s illuminated by this action of resignations on the part of certain members of the Opposition, it is this that they have no concern what so ever with the momentous issues which are facing the nation today. This nation is facing those issues which are far-reaching and momentous, having a bearing on the security of India and which were going to be discussed from the floors of the Parliament. They are not interested in them. They are not interested in the far-reaching developments which are taking place in Sri Lanka..*(Interruptions)*..the far-reaching developments

which are taking place in our relationship with Pakistan, the far-reaching developments which are taking place in Afghanistan, the far-reaching pieces of legislation which will determine the future course of democracy in th country, involving devolution of power to the people at the grass-roots to shape their social and economic destiny for the betterment of their own, these issues are of no concern to them. What is the concern to them? The only concern to them is character-assassination of the hon. Prime Minister. This happens to be the last session of the Lok Sabha. The Opposition came to attend this...(*Interruptions*) Is the way? We have listened to them. They should listen to us.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Order, please.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: The question before this hon. House for which the permission has been granted is. Why have they resigned? For the last one week, we have been witnessing nothing but theatrical histrionics from the floors of both the Houses. (*Interruptions*) The Opposition came to attend this session with the calculated design of using this particular session for launching an electoral campaign and nothing else. Their actions, their theatrical histrionics and their resignations have to be considered in the context of this calculated design on their part. They are least interested in the issue, which were going to be discussed, and momentous issues which were going to be discussed in both the Houses of the Parliament. But they were interested in one and only thing, and that is their election campaign. And what else can you expect from that Opposition which is led by the nose by one person who himself is nothing but a film actor? That Opposition which allows itself to be led by a film actor cannot be expected to do anything more than indulge in theatrical histrionics even on the two floors of the Parliament. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : What is all this? Why should he refer to this thing?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : It is all within the parameters.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : How?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : I am hearing every word. It is all within the parameters.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : How does it come into the picture?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : He wants to say how it has developed.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : He is not a Member. He is not among those who resigned today. Why should be bring in this unncecessary thing? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI YASHWANT SINHA : If a briefless lawyer can come and talk here, then certainly a film actor can be the leader of the Oppostition.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : If a pilot can rule the country, why not a film actor? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : The hon. Member from Telugu Desam talked in terms of political morality. This is the most ironic statement which has been made from the floor of this hon. House today. (*Interruptions*) I would like to remind him and the Members of this hon. House that in the latest case against the Leader of the Party to which he belongs, challenging his action in taking upon himself to act as a film actor while holding the post of a Chief Minister..(*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : How is it relevant ?

SHRI MOTURU HANUMANTHA RAO : Sir, he should not be allowed to speak like this. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : Sir, I want to say only one thing that the stand which has been taken...

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : He is a real actor and not a fake actor like Rajiv Gandhi..

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : I am submitting only this that their concept of political morality is just...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : In their concept of political morality, Arun Govil was brought by his party to campaign for Sunil Shastri.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : I want to make one submission that he openly made a statement that he is not bound by the code of conduct which has been prescribed for the Chief Ministers and that he has a right to carry on any trade, any profession or any calling and exploit his image as a Chief Minister by acting in films. This is his political morality. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Mr. Madan Bhatia, this is not within the parameters, please do not bring it in.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : I am coming to that.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Before Mr. Madan Bhatia took the floor, did I not remind you that he was a*

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Please do not record it.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: ...and is it not proved that he is indulging in* (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : Sir, I strongly protest against the personal remarks. (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Please refrain from making personal remarks.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : I can also use that language.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : Is* unparliamentary? Show me the book of unparliamentary words?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): It is not in good taste. It is about a sitting Member of this House.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Against a Chief Minister he can say all those things. (*Interruptions*).

श्री वीरेन्द्र वर्मा : क्वाइट आफ आर्डर। ...(व्यवधान)

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : It is not in good taste.

श्री विरेन्द्र वर्मा : इन्होंने जो कहा वह एक्सपंज कर दिया और जो वे कह रहे हैं लगातार ? चीफ मिनिस्टर आंध्र प्रदेश के खिलाफ लगातार कर रहे हैं ?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : That case has nothing to do with this. About the Chief Minister you want to say something.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : I am on the concept of political morality. Sir, the basic issue before this Hon. House...

*Not recorded.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : They brought Arun Govil to campaign against V.P. Singh in Allahabad. What is their political morality?

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : You go and ask your people, they will tell you.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : I ask you.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : You should not talk of political morality. What are you doing in West Bengal ? Go and ask the Chief Minister whose reports have appeared in the newspapers.

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : I know my Chief Minister. I am not going to listen to you, the person who supported emergency. The people have discarded those who imposed the emergency in 1975 and here is an advocate who supported the emergency. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : Sir, the political character assassination in which the Opposition is indulging in today is not a new phenomenon in the political history of India. When Mrs. Gandhi raised the voice of socialism in this country in 1969 and they found it impossible to fight with her on ideological plane it was in 1969 that they invented this weapon of political character assassination against her, and this weapon they had been using against Mrs. Gandhi during her whole lifetime, from 1969 to 1984. What did they do from 1977 to 1980? When they came to power, they did not leave any stone unturned... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY : My speech was truncated by the Deputy Chairman's ruling—may I remind you—that I should confine myself within the parameters. What is all this now ?

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : It is within the parameters.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Why do you allow all this trash ?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Whether you like it or not, it is within the parameters.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : From 1977 to 1988, they unleashed the campaign of character assassination and vilification not only against Mrs. Gandhi but against all members of her family. They used the Commissions of Inquiry against them; they used the criminal codes against them ; they used imprisonment and expulsion from Parliament against her.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGEH DESAI) : That is not necessary.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : I am submitting because this is important. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : Why do you bring in Mrs. Gandhi now ? It is Rajiv Gandhi now. Sir, he is going to Mrs. Gandhi, then to Jawaharlal Nehru. Let us confine to Rajiv Gandhi. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : But she destroyed all their possible weapons of vilification and character assassination against her. Today they have started wielding the same weapon against the hon. Prime Minister. They are asking us to go to the people. We are going to the people. We shall strip you naked before the people of India for your political hypocrisy, your political bankruptcy. We shall throw you by the wayside as the history is going to laugh at you with a snaring smile. Don't forget that the battle is going to be joined before the people very

[Shri Madan Bhatia]

soon and we are going to expose you before the people as to how you tried to destroy the institution of Parliament by scuttling democracy, by avoiding....(*Interruptions.*)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH : A nominated Member....(*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : He is a Member of the House.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : I will just take one or two minutes. I am respectfully submitting that there are two basic postulates of parliamentary democracy. One is the discussion and debate, and it is the discussion and debate which they have tried to scuttle in both Houses of Parliament. The other postulate of democracy is that a government which is elected by the people through over whelming majority has, under the Constitution, the right to govern for the period prescribed by the Constitution and Mr. Rajiv Gandhi, the hon. Prime Minister and the Congress Party are not going to oblige you by resigning before the period of five years expires. Your duty is to criticise the government and the majority in Parliament.... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : He wants to repeat for the benefit of Mr. Fotedar.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : They had a right given under the Constitution to criticise the government, to join against the government in the form of discussions and debates from the floors of the two Houses. They have forfeited that right by giving resignations themselves. They have tried to scuttle democracy in this country. I do feel why hon. Members have not been able to appreciate the sacrifice which has been made by 106 Members. The sacrifice which they have made is that they have given up three months' salary.... (*Interruptions*). But I want to give them a word of consolation. I am on the resignation issue.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Please conclude now. I cannot allow.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : I am concluding. The hon. Member from the B.J.P. talked about the Constitution. He said that under the Constitution there cannot be any debate on the report of the C. & A.G. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI SUKOMAL SEN : Sir, is there no limit for him ? (*Interruptions*).

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Others also have taken a lot of time. (*Interruptions*) This side will get two-thirds' time and the other side will get one-third's time. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : Sir, I will read just two lines. I have already dealt with this matter. But I will read just two lines from a book written by a former Comptroller and Auditor-General. He says : "Audit being an agency for the exercise...." (*Interruptions*). Look a. them. They have the aspiration to govern India ! This is their sense of democracy. This is their sense of freedom of speech. (*Interruptio's*) He says in this book : "Audit being an agency for the exercise of Parliamentary control over institutions, Parliament is the forum for the consideration of audit Reports".

The hon. Member quoted the Constitution to say that the report of the Comptroller and Auditor-General cannot be discussed in Parliament. When he is cornered by one clarification which is sought,

he pipes down and says 'What I mean is, attacks cannot be made but the report can be discussed'. He was cornered because it was brought to his notice that his own leaders were party to the discussion which they sought to initiate on the floor of the House. This is the confusion from which the Opposition is suffering. This is the hypocrisy which they want to inflict on the people of India. I would respectfully submit, Sir,....

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI) : Please conclude.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA : It has reached the right quarters.

SHRI MADAN BHATIA : I am concluding. I will take just half-a-minute more.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : Let him take half-a-minute but he cannot imitate Amrish Puri in the House.

ठाकुर जगतपाल सिंह: आपोजीशन थबड़ा गया है।

SHRI MADAN BHATIA: Sir, they have shown no respect for Parliament. They have shown no respect for freedom of discussion. They have shown no respect for the voice of the people. They have tried to hoodwink the people by this kind of theatrical action of theirs. They hope to garner votes by hoodwinking the people by actions such as this. Let me assure them that the people are going to throw them into the dustbin of histroy. Thank you.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Mr. Balu. Two minutes. (*Interruptions*) It was agreed to by the leaders of the opposition that the remaining Members would be given two minutes each.

SHRI T. R. BALU (Tamil Nadu); Mr. Vice-Chairman, Sir,... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Sir, I request that the sitting may be extended beyond 6 p. m.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): The House will sit beyond 6 p. m. to complete the Business.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: Sir, we are adjouring at 6 p. m. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. M. JACOB: It is not for you. It is for the House to decide. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA ; We want division. You take the sense of the House. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M. M. JACOB : I mo that the sitting may of the House be extended beyond 6 p.m.(*Interruptions*

SOME HON. MEMBERS; No, no.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI); The sense of the House is that we will sit beyond 6.00 p.m.

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY;Do not break the convention We cannot sit beyond six. (*Interruptions*). We will have a division. We have agreed to sit till six. Without our consent you cannot sit beyond 6.00 O'clock.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI). Is it the consent of the House ?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY; What is the use? All of us constitute the House, you and I together. Let us have a division.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: Is it the minority running the House?

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: What do you mean by minority?

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Let me read out the decision of the Business Advisory Committee. It says.

> "The Committee also recommended that the House should sit upto 6.00 P.M. daily and beyond 6.00 P.M. as and when necessary for the transaction of Government Legislative and other Business."

SHRI M. S. GURUPADASWAMY: With the consent of the House.

SHRI VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): I will take sense of the House.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: On a point of order. May I draw your attention to rule 37 which refers to variation in the allocation of time order? It says:

> "No variation in the allocation of time order shall be made except by the Chairman, who may make such variation if he is satisfied after taking the sense of the Council that there is a general agreement for such variation."

Here the words have been used very cautiously for the first time. Other decisions may be carried by a majority but the words used are that there is a general agreement for such variation. The meaning is that even if there is a small minority which says 'no' to it, we should not sit, it should not be done and here in this case it is not a small minority, the whole majority of this House is saying 'no'. In fact, if you were to take a vote, perhaps this will be the larger side and there is no general agreement for such variation. These words are very clear.

SHRI M. M. JACOB: If the version of Mr. Advani were to be accepted, the word should have been 'unanimous'. The word 'unanimous' has not been used.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: I leave it at that. If you feel that there is a general agreement, it is, for the Chair to decide.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: Sir, this rule would not apply because the decision of the Business Advisory Committee is already there.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: You will be setting up a wrong precedent.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): At least you should sit till this item is over. After that I will give a ruling.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: For this item we will sit, but not after this.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): After this item is over you leave it to me, I will think over.

6.00 P.M.

SHRI PARVATHANENI UPENDRA: No, no, no thinking over it. If you consider that two or three speakers are there and if you want this item to be finished today, let this be finished. But beyond that we will not sit.

SHRI T. R. BALU: Today the Lower House of the Indian Parliament witnessed the unprecendeted mass resignations by the Members of the Opposition as a protest against the denigration of the parliamentary institutions by the ruling party. I wish to put on record the services and sacrifices of the brave parliamentarians who have fought against the ruling party which has denigrated the parliamentary institutions. Definitely their memory will ever be persisting with the public in the

history of Indian Parliament, whereas the attitude and adamancy of the ruling party will be reflected in the ensuing elections to Parliament, for which the ruling party is answerable and definitely those who are responsible for the undoing of democracy will be identified as Don Quixotes and Sancho Panzas.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, आपने इस महत्वपूर्ण मुद्दे पर मुझे बोलने का जो मौका दिया है, उसके लिये मैं आपके प्रति कृतज्ञता व्यक्त करता हूं ।

आज भारत में ही नहीं, विश्व में संसदीय परम्पराओं पर जिस तरह से खुलेआम तमाचा मारा गया है और अपने शेड्यूल काल के, अपने निर्धारित समय के पहले कुछ सांसदों ने इस्तीफा दिया है, उसने सनसनी फैलाने की एक नाकाम कोशिश की गई हैं ।

माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, यह सदन बड़ा पवित्र सदन है और यह इस देश का प्राथमिक, सर्वोच्च सदन है । इसमें प्रतिनिधियों के प्रतिनिधि के रूप में हम हम यहां बैठे हैं, चाहे किसी दल के हों, किसी प्रांत के हों, किसी कौम के हों, किसी कास्ट और क्रीड के हों, हम प्रतिनिधि हैं । भारतीय संसद में स्वतंत्रता के बाद जिस तरह की जिस तरह के . . .*(व्यवधान)

श्री राम अवधेश सिंह (बिहार) : मान्यवर, यह –शब्द अनपार्लिया मेंटरी है . . .*(व्यवधान)

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : मैं आभास कराना चाहता हूं कि *इस सदन में हो रही है और चेयर पर बैठे हुये अध्यक्षों के साथ बहुत अपमानजनक व्यवहार किया गया है ।

---

*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

अगर हम संसद के सदस्य हैं, तो उससे शर्म से हमारा माथा झुक जाना चाहिये । तो जिस तरह की आज स्थिति बनाई गई, इसके पीछे बहुत बड़ी साजिश माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि चल रही है ।

आज कभी विश्वामित्र का अवतार बनने वाला व्यक्ति, कभी विवेकानन्द का अवतार बनने वाला व्यक्ति 69–70 साल की उम्र में साधू बन कर के रूप बना करके तपस्वी का जो रासलीलायें रच रहा है, उस लीला रचने वाले व्यक्ति ने एक डाइरेक्टिव दिया और उस पर संसद के . . . (**व्यवधान**) मैं किसी का नाम नहीं ले रहा हूं ।

श्री मोहम्मद खलीलुर रहमान (आंध्र प्रदेश) : आप बैठे क्या तमाशा देख रहे हैं ? अभी क्या हो रहा है, वह क्या बोल रहे हैं ? **यह क्या हो रहा है ? क्या बोल रहा है यह ? इसको आप रोक दीजिए । इसको रिकार्ड से निकाल दीजिए ।. . . (व्यवधान)**

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): I don't want anybody to interrupt. Otherwise I will stop the proceedings.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : मैंने नाम नहीं लिया है ।

श्री मोहम्मद खलीलुर रहमान : यह रिकार्ड से निकालने के लिए कहा जाय । . . . (व्यवधान)

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : हजारों एकड़ जमीन का घोटाला करने वाले लोग खुलेआम अपनी पौत्रवधु की हत्या का वाले लोग . . . (व्यवधान) . . . आज राजीव गांधी पर अंगुली उठा रहे हैं और कह रहे हैं इस्तीफा दे दो। चादर लहरा रहे हैं कि इस्तीफा दे दो, हम बहस नहीं करेंगे । मैं कहना चाहता हूं इस सदन के माध्यम से, हमारे पूर्व वक्ता कह रहे थे कि आज संसद के कई सदस्य

[डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय]

शहीद हो गए । आंखों में कुलंजन लगाकर रोने वाले लोग जनता के हमदर्द बने हैं ।

माननीय उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, गांधीजी ने इस देश को स्वतंत्र किया, रामराज की परिकल्पना की, उसी रामराज के पथ पर नेहरू जी ने नए उद्योग स्थापित करते हुए और पंचवर्षीय योजनाओं के माध्यम से व्यवस्थित ढंग से भारत के निर्माण का काम किया । इंदिरा जी ने बैंकों का राष्ट्रीयकरण किया, प्रिवी को समाप्त किया और भूगोल को बदल दिया, इतिहास तो सब शासक बदलते हैं, लेकिन 84,000 सैनिकों ने, बाजपेयी जो यहां बैठे हुए हैं, वाजपेयी जी की राष्ट्रीयता पर जो शंका करता है, उसकी नागरिकता छीन ली जानी चाहिए, राष्ट्रीय व्यक्ति है, उस समय इन्होंने कहा था दुर्गा का अवतार हुआ है, 84,000 सैनिकों ने आत्म समर्पण किया था । पुराण, इतिहास उठाकर देख लीजिए किसी शासक के सामने भारत में 84,000 सैनिकों ने आत्म समर्पण नहीं किया । पाकिस्तान दो हिस्सों में बंट गया, पाकिस्तान और बंगला देश बन गया और वह भी शहीद हो गई । ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री लक्ष्मण भाई पाणी : इंदिरा जी के लिए भी बाजपेयी जी का सर्टिफिकेट चाहिए, यह हालत हो गई है ।

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : और उसके बेटे ने, मैं कहना चाहता हूं, इस सदन के माध्यम से, पूरी रिस्पोंसिबिल्टी के साथ कहना चाहता हूं, पूरे होशोहवाश में रिकार्ड करवाना चाहता हूं कि जो काम जवहर लाल नेहरू ने नहीं किया, जो इंदिरा गांधी का सपना था और पूरा नहीं हुआ था, उसे राजीव गांधी ने पूरा किया, गांव में पंचायती राज को जो अधिकार दिया है, ... (व्यवधान)... राजीव गांधी ने जवाहर रोजगार योजना की शुरूआत की है, राजीव गांधी ने 18 वर्ष के वोटिंग-राइट का अधिकार दिया है, राजीव गांधी ने तीस परसेंट महिलाओं को सुरक्षा दी है जनप्रतिनिधित्व की दृष्टि से आपोजीशन के लीग जुगनू हैं, राजीव गांधी सूरज है । मैं रिकार्ड कराना चाहता हूं, इस सदन में ।

माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मैं कई बार कह चुका हूं कि**

नाजायज ढंग से प्रोपर्टी बटोरी है' वह तो बटोरी... (व्यवधान) ... आप सुनिए । मैं इसलिए कह रहा हूं माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, मेरे पास यह रिकार्ड है, इस सदन में मैं इसे रिकार्ड कराना चाहता हूं।...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश देशाई) : इसे रहने दीजिए पाण्डेय जी ।

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : नहीं, देखिए, यह बहुत इम्पोर्टेंट है, राष्ट्रीय एकता का प्रश्न है, इसे सुन लीजिए, मैं करबद्ध प्रार्थना कर रहा हूं ।

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: CIA agents should not go on record. There must be some sense of proportion.

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, 21 जुलाई के इंडियन एबोड से थोड़े से अंश आपको सुनाऊंगा। 21 जुलाई, 1989 के इंडियन-एब्रोड के 48वें पेज पर छपा है–

"Jethmalani, in U.S., plugs V.P. Singh."

"Ram Jethmalani, the Bombay jurist, said he had met with nearly a dozen members ... (*Interruptions*)

**Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

हल्ला मत करो, सुनो । माननीय उपसभाध्यक्ष जी, इस सदन को कंट्रोल करिए । ** के लोग यू.एस.ए. में जाकर बात करते हैं, मैं बताना चाहता हूं कि सी. आई.ए. इस देश को तहस-नहस करने के लिए । ...(व्यवधान)... मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूं । सुनने की हिम्मत चाहिए । मैं सड़क पर जनता के बीच भाषण नहीं कर रहा हूं । इस सर्वोच्च सदन में यह रिकार्ड कराना चाहता हूं कि राम जेठमलानी सी०आय०ए० से मिलकर, यू० एस०ए० में टिककर इस देश को नष्ट करना चाहता है ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश देसाई) : अगर इस प्रकार से आप किसी को * कहेंगे तो रिकार्ड में नहीं आएगा ।

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY : "In an interview with *India abroad*, Jethmalani said he would not disclose the names of the Congress members he had met on July 12 because he feared the Indian embassy, with 'its strong lobbying power, would seek to undo my efforts.' However, he said he had met with both Republican and Democrat members."

और इसमें खालिस्तान के गुरुद्वारों के लोगों से राम जेठमलानी ने जो कुछ कहा है, उन्होंने कहा है कि---

Prominent leaders ofthe...

THE VICE CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Dr. Pandey, it is not the subject.

DR. RATNAKAR PANDEY: Why not, Sir ? I am a Parliamentarian and I am quoting a thing.*

SHRI M.S. GURUPADASWAMY: Will you allow this, Sir?

*Expunged as ordered by the air.

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : ...(व्यवधान) ...और यू० एस० में टिककर... (व्यवधान)...प्रधान मंत्री बने यहां हमारे कैबिनेट के मंत्री लोग बैठे हैं । मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि अगर इस देश में सरकार नाम की कोई चीज है तो बार-बार मांग की गयी है कि आप वी०पी० सिंह को गिरफ्तार करो, राम जेठमलानी को गिरफ्तार करो । महोदय, गुरुपदस्वामी जी हमारे बहुत बड़े नेता हैं । हम लोग बचपन से इनका नाम सुनते आ रहे हैं चाहे आपोजीशन में हो या शासन में हों, वे एक इंदिरा जी के हत्यारे को दल में लाए और राम जेठमलानी कहता है---

"A pre-election understanding had made it clear that V.P. Singh, a former Finance and Defence Minister, would head a new Government and Ramakrishna Hegde, former Karnatna Chief Minister, would be in the second position, Jethmalani said."

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश देसाई) : आपका टाइम हो गया ।

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : वहां सी०आय०ए० के लोगों से मिलकर स जिश हो रही है और उसी के तहत लोकसभा से इस्तीफा दिया । यहां बैठे हुए हमारे मित्रों ने अगर बोतल का दूध पिया है तो ठीक है लेकिन अगर अपनी मां का दूध पिया है तो इस सदन से बाहर निकलें । हम गलियों में, कूचों में हर जगह उनसे मुकाबला करने को तैयार हैं । हम न कहीं भी ...(व्यवधान)... तो इस सदन को छोड़ देंगे ।

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश देसाई) : मिस्टर चित्त बसु। पाण्डेय जी आपका भाषण हो गया ।

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : और मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि इस देश के जनतंत्र के इतिहास में लिखा जाएगा कि एक समय ऐसा भी आया जब सदन में ...(व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: You said two minues. I want to know by how many seconds two minutes are constituted?

DR. NAGEN SAIKIA (Assam) : Sir, should he be allowed to continue in his way?

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश देसाई) : पाण्डेय जी आप बैठ जाइए । चार मिन्ट के सात मिन्ट हो गए हैं ।

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि पंचायती राज के संबंध में हम कानून बनाने की ओर अग्रसर हो रहे हैं । जब हम इस देश में शक्ति के विकेंद्रीकरण की शुरूआत गांव के स्तर से कर रहे हैं । अभी तक जबकि ए० सी० में बैठकर इस देश को प्लानिंग होती थी अब हम गांव से प्लानिंग शुरू करेंगे और इसके लिए हम पंचायती राज की योजना को शुरू कर रहे हैं... (व्यवधान)

उपसभाध्यक्ष (श्री जगेश देसाई) : अब हो गया पाण्डेय जी ।

डा० रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : (व्यवधान)... ...जैसे 42 में कम्युनिस्टों ने भाग था और स्वतंत्र होने के बाद भारतीय जनता पार्टी के लोगों ने गांधी जी की हत्या की थी... (व्यवधान)... धन्यवाद ।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (मध्य प्रदेश) : इन्होंने हमारी पार्टी पर आरोप लगाया है। ...(व्यवधान)

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: I am on a point of order. It is good that you have ordered for expunction of certain remarks. It is not only a question of ordering for expunction of certain remarks made by certain Members who are responsible Members but you should also appeal to the leader or leaders of that party that their Members should not indulge in such type of statements being made here.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): Both sides. ...(*Interruptions*)...

डा. रत्नाकर पाण्डेय : मैंने सत्य को कहा है और सत्य कड़वा होता है । ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI DIPEN GHOSH: Is he a Barbie doll? Is he getting some screw? He is speaking and speaking.

MESSAGE FROM THE LOK SABHA

Delhi Motor Vehicles Taxation (Amendment) Bill, 1989.

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, I have to report to the House the folloing message received from the Lok Sabha signed by the Secretary-General of the Lok Sabha:

"In accordance with the provision of rule 96 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, I am directed to enclose the Delhi Motor Vehicles Taxation (Amendment) Bill, 1989 as passed by Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 21st July, 1989.

2. The Speaker has certified that this Bill is a Money Bill within the meaning of article 110 of the Constitution of India."

Sir, I lay the Bill on the Table.

RE: RESIGNATION BY OPPOSITION MEMBERS FROM LOK SABHA—*Contd.*

SHRI CHITTA BASU (WEST BENGAL): I think I should go by your advice but you should also know your own responsibility.

THE VICE-CHAIRMAN (SHRI JAGESH DESAI): That is all right. You speak for four minutes. I